Journal of Peace, Development and Communication



Volume 08, Issue 02, April-June 2024 pISSN: 2663-7898, eISSN: 2663-7901

Article DOI: https://doi.org/10.36968/JPDC-V08-I02-24

Homepage: https://pdfpk.net/pdf/
Email: se.jpdc@pdfpk.net

Article:	Framing of Pulwama Attack in English Press: An Analysis from Pakistan in Context of Indo-Pak Conflict			
	Masroor Ahmad Deputy Director, Pakistan Bait-ul-Mal Head Office, Islamabad			
Author(s):	Kiran Tauseef MS Media and Communication, Bahria University Islamabad			
	Usman Sadiq Independent Researcher, Studied Archaeology, Quaid -I-Azam University, Islamabad.			
Published:	25 th June 2024			
Publisher Information:	Journal of Peace, Development and Communication (JPDC)			
To Cite this Article:	Ahmed, M., Tauseef, K., & Sadiq, U. (2024). Framing of Pulwama Attack in English Press: An Analysis from Pakistan in Context of Indo-Pak Conflict. <i>Journal of Peace, Development and Communication</i> , 08(02), 313–339. https://doi.org/10.36968/JPDC-V08-I02-24			
	Masroor Ahmad is serving as a Deputy Director in Pakistan Bait-ul-Mal Head Office, Islamabad Email: mindshare2000@gmail.com, vf-masroor.ahmad@szabist-isb.pk			
Author(s) Note:	Kiran Tauseef is a MS of Media and Communication from Bahria University Islamabad Email: krntauseef@gmail.com			
	Usman Sadiq is an Independent Researcher from Studied Archaeology, Quaid -I- Azam University, Islamabad. Email: mindshare124@gmail.com			

ABSTRACT

The Pulwama attack on February 14, 2019 in the Indian administered Kashmir, worsened the Indo-Pak bilateral relation and brought both the nuclear states on the verge of war. In the ever growing and unending hostility between these rival states, the role of media is worth discussion as it plays important role in constructing war, peace, ideologies, and dissemination of these frames. This research employed the framing theory of Erving Goffman (1974) and discourse analysis coupled with Entman (1993) model of framing-as functionalized in the studies of Papacharissi& Oliveira, (2008); Semetko&Valkenburg, (2000) to examine the coverage of Pulwama attack in Kashmir in Dawn and The News newspapers, one of the leading English language dailies in Pakistan. This study analyzed the editorials of elite English press of India and Pakistan regarding the Pulwama attack and the unrest created due to this terror attack. The study critically analyzed the mediated themes to reveal the dominant frames used by elite newspapers of Pakistan vis-à-vis the Kashmir conflict. The findings unveil that both the selected newspapers namely Dawn and The News used different frames and themes to conceptualize the Pulwama attack. Both the newspapers carried the elite oriented approach as well as bilateral cum human rights issue having repercussions for regional peace. The study concludes that the elite press reproduced and reinforced the dominant narratives and closely followed the foreign policy discourse of their respective countries. The study found that both Dawn and The News were dominated by the theme of Kashmir cause and episodic frames and less focus was given to Pakistan's stance on Kashmir and the thematic frame during the conflict of Pulwama terror attack.

Keywords: Framing, Kashmir conflict, Pulwama Pakistan, DAWN, The News, Elites

Introduction

Pakistan and India have been harvesting the most intractable conflict in South Asia since their independence in August 1947, emerging with departure of the British. The echo of the conflict is very often heard on various international forums as well. This dissertation investigates and analyzes the episodic and thematic themes used for framing of Pulwama attack in leading Newspapers of Pakistan. Scholars give the opinion that audience reliability to mass media (particularly news media) results into information, persuasion, agenda setting, and framing effects (Tewksbury &Schenfele, 2008). Hence, Mass media has the power to make and change our perceptions regarding people, issues, and events. Scholars believe that since people are largely dependent on media for news and information so the media play a pivotal role in manipulating people's cognition and perceptions about various disputes/ conflicts among states/ groups/ individuals and other international affairs. Conflicting parties are well cognizant of this fact, and they use media for their warring propaganda purposes to influence the public opinion. Despite the fact that the new media or social media with the arrival of internet has eclipsed the impact of traditional print media in modern times due to proximity the significance and importance of print media is still prevalent and is particularly considered as major source of academic research. Both Pakistan and India have fought three full-fledged wars in addition to sever other deadly skirmishes on their borders insisting upon their equitable claim to Kashmir, and have come close to a fourth conflict on innumerable occasions (Islam 2019) including the Pulwama terror attack. Indian occupied Jammu and Kashmir with 12.55 million (census of India, 2011), 4.5 million in Pakistani-run Azad Kashmir (census of Pakistan, 2017) and about 10,000 people inhabited in Aksai Chin which is controlled by China (2017) Census). There are many languages spoken in Kashmir with at least 9.2 million people speaking 'Kaushur' language while there are so many different languages such as Pahari, Dogri, Balti, Shina and Ladakhi, etc spoken and understood in the valley. In 1948 both India and Pakistan fought a full scale war dominated by Pakistan thus forcing India to pledge for ceasefire in United Nations which was granted with the provision that India will cooperate for plebiscite in Kashmir and the future of Kashmir will be determined by the vote of common Kashmiris. India after strengthening itsposition in Kashmir refused to hold plebiscite under one or the other excuse thus restricting Kashmiris to vote either for Pakistan or India till date (Bülbül 2019).

An insight into the Indo-Pak conflict

The Kashmir conflict has eclipsed the hope of cordial relations between India and Pakistan unlike the vision of Jinnah, the founder of Pakistan and it is the need of the hour that this most convoluted irritant i.e. Kashmir issue should be resolved or the future of the region will be eclipsed. Although there are many other issues between India and Pakistan like Sir Creek, Siachin, Wullar Barrage, and terrorism, yet Kashmir dispute is mother of all conflicts between both the countries. The India–Pakistan rivalry has very often caught sight of the international community as both the countries bear the burden of Kashmir—the most enduring and unresolved conflicts of the world. There are many reasons behind this conflict comprising of common perceptions and mistrust, dominating sense of self and image of 'others', with different heroes in the history, foreign invasions resulting in their settlements in India and the divergent strategic interests. The very foundation of India and Pakistan was based on conflict as both the countries were demarcated out of violent and bloody partition in result of mistrust

and malice towards each other on religious grounds. The stubborn stance of each country against the other definesthemin hostility towards the other. Despite resourcefulness, the development in the region of South Asia has become hostage to the unending conflict between Pakistan and India (Delinic., Pandey, 2012). There is lack of confidence building measures and people-to-people relations between both the countries and their mutual relations are captive to burden of history. The antagonistic attitudes of both the countries carry the unpleasant bitterness of the partition process, self-elevation, negative perceptions about each other and trust deficit unwilling to foresee the emerging dimensions in international relations. In modern civilization, normally the conflicts are either resolved through certain sustainable measures or sometimes compromised with economic gains, bilateral relations, and trades but this is a wild goose chase in perspective of India and Pakistan. The other conflicts between India and Pakistan like Siachinglacier, Wullar barrage, Tulbul Navigation Project and Sir Creek are relatively easy to resolve and may not remain an issue when the Kashmir conflict is amicably resolved. There have already been positive deliberations on aforementioned issues and some issues like distribution of water resources have been resolved through Indus water treaty but the major conflict of Kashmir sweep away all the solutions. The ruling elite of both the countries is ruthless enough to yield any relief to the common people of the region by adopting a vibrant approach towards peace than conflict. On the other hand due to massive illiteracy or poor structure of education the popular opinion in both the countries is war or conflict-oriented. The geopolitics has dominated in terms of getting tactical wins and lost the prospects for mutual gains.

Indo-Pak rift and Pulwama

The media massively covered the Pulwama conflict in the aftermath of 14 Feb 2019, when a bomber smashed into an explosive-laden car into a convoy comprising of 16 vehicles of CRPF, inPulwama district of Indian held Kashmir killing more than 40 personnel (The News, 2019). In a video released on social media, the Jaish e Mohammad (JeM), a proscribed organisationtook the responsibility of the deadliest suicide attack in decades. The echo of this explosion was of such magnitude that it was felt 30 km away in Srinagar (Ashiq, The Hindu, 2019). India held Pakistan responsible for the attack for JeM being an organization based in Pakistan, although the latter condemned the attack and denied having any connection to it (Qureshi, DAWN, 2019). India won sympathies of the global community as the terror attack was widely condemned whereas following the attack the already fraught relations between India and Pakistan further strained to the level that it almost precipitated a war between them. Moreover, the personnel killed in the attack belonged to various Indian states, which created nationwide aggression and put pressure on the Indian Government for revengeful action against Pakistan. Since the personnel of CRPF killed in the suicidal attack belonged to different Indian states it created a nationwide grief and anger in India. The India became obsessed with the attack and intended to punish Pakistan due to the mounting pressure by Indian media and civil society.on 26 January, 12 Indian Air Force Mirage 2000 jets dropped 1,000 kg bombs on suspected Jaish-e-Mohammed camps across the Line of Control (LoC) in Muzaffarabad sector at 3.30am, (India Today, 2019) mounting counter pressure on Pakistan for prompt response to the Indian aggression. In response to the Indian aggression and violation of International borders, Pakistan retaliated on 27 February 2019, by conducting airstrikes, just across the Line of Control (LOC) which is unofficial border that divides the Himalayan region of Kashmirwhile Pakistancaptured a fighter pilot of India. As a good will gesture, Pakistan announced to release the Indian fighter pilot as a measure for the de-escalation of the growing conflict and to avoid any further risk of divergence with India particularly any nuclear-armed conflict. The Prime Minister of Pakistan termed the release of Indian fighter pilot a "peace gesture," while on the other hand India claimed that Pakistan just observed the law of "Geneva Convention". The Pulwama attack and the situation arising from it internationalized the venerable Kashmir conflict and Kashmir conflict was considered as a potential threat to the global peace and regional harmony. In the meantime Kashmir conflict stayed the center of attention and dominated the public discourse both in Pakistan and India. Research shows that media coverage significantly influences public policy and ultimately cultivates peoples' attitude, thus it becomes pertinent that the content published on media to be subjected to penetrating scholarly scrutiny in the context of framing. Both India and Pakistan have the most vibrant media- particularly print media. Print media still has enormous circulation, and seize essential place in peoples' daily lives. Since, this terror attack has escalated the tension between both the countries never witnessed before and framing of the incident at both sides had significant role in creating hatred at both side of the border. The study is aiming to investigate that how Pakistani press has framed the Pulwama terror incident in Indian occupied Kashmir from lenses of news framing model. The study focuses on the framing of Pulwama attack in two leading Newspapers of Pakistan 'Dawn' and 'The News' starting from the incident, which took place on 14 February 2019 till 05 March, 2019.

Significance of English Print Media in Pakistan

The English print media in Pakistan is widely read in the officials as well as diplomatic circles and is considered as moderate media in comparison with Urdu Newspapers. As the English is also the national language of Pakistan so there is good number of English readers. Although print media is passing through changing times yet it has not lost its significance as most of the media house have adapted the modern techniques and there online editions have quite good readership. However, the communication revolution through the social and electronic media is affecting the significance of print media in so many ways. Nevertheless, the value, importance, and significance of print media is still valid contrary to a common misconception. Infact, the innovative spread of the Internet and its rapid use has made the accessibility of print media convenient to the readers. Giving more space to readers' views is considered in dispensible now a days. The modern reader is smart enough to read between the lines and the smart readers are cognizant with the agenda setting and framing. The most important divergence between print and other media is that of readership. Print media is still privileged with consistent viewership. It is easy to use the references of print media for any academic research in comparison with other mediums. The competition of the audience of electronic media with the readers of print media has been an interesting topic of academic researches. The audience of a channel is more impulsive than the readership of a newspaper, as a viewer has the choice to switch to another channel anytime in comparison with reader of a newspaper. The very important significance of print media is that it provides ample space for feedback from its readers which is an added advantage over other means of media. It has been noted that if common norms of decency are followed, English newspapers give enough liberty to their readers to express their view on a particular issue.

Significance of the study

Post-Pulwama days have seen the most perilous confrontation between Pakistan and India and mutual relations between both the countries have yet not been normalized. It has resulted in sever breach of the sanctity of the international borders and line of control (LOC) from both the parties. According to the foreign office of Pakistan, India violated ceasefire 3000 times in 2020 (XINHUANET, 2020). Similarly, India also keep on summoning Pakistani High commissioner in New Delhi for ceasefire violations (The Hindu, 2020). A suicide bombing in Kashmir on an Indian security forces convoy (by an Indian Kashmiri namely Adil Dar), followed by revenge acrobats by Indian and Pakistani warplanes, almost brought the two nuclear-armed powers on the verge of a catastrophic stand-off. After Jammu and Kashmir Reorganisation Bill, Pakistan suspended bilateral and trade dealings with India, recalled the Pakistani ambassador to India, and expelled the High Commissioner of India to Pakistan (India Today, 2019). The further significance of the study is that it provides a future road map for regional cooperation on the model of European Union for peaceful co-existence, trade relations, and people-to-people contacts bringing harmony and discouraging the blame game trend on both sides of theborder. In previous studies war and peace frames have widely been discussed regarding Indo-Pak conflicts but there has been little research attempt on episodic and thematic frames and the present study is an effort so far to address the research gap on the same. This study has filled the vacuum in analyzing the data regarding episodic and thematic frames in Pakistani English newspapers.

Objectives

United Nations (UN) is best forum for resolution of war and conflict which deploys peace missions in different conflicting regions of the world, however, the issue of Kashmir so far has not been resolved at platform of United Nations (UN) till date which has caused great human tragedies and the region is at brink of nuclear flash point. The objectives of the research are as under:

- 1. To examine the extent of framing journalism in selected newspapers
- 2. To examine the distribution of the themes
- 3. To examine the distribution of the frames
- 4. To examine the relationship between themes and frames
- 5. To give a guideline to policy makers through this research
- 6. To analyze the optics and perception through selective media in the backdrop of Pulwama attack.

Framing of conflicts

Peace is unstructured and wide-ranging. Media in this sense act as national prisms and a site of ideological wars, constructing political and historical narratives for nations (Lee at el., 2001). Media role becomes crucial when it comes to covering conflict related news. News organizations are often the first informers for the public, especially in times of war, or political tensions (Bagdikian, 2005). Wolfsfeld (2004) acknowledges in his article, that the nature of media by default is to cover disputes, conflicts, violence, and tension. During the conflict involving two countries, news media are argued to invoke nationalistic feelings among the local audiences (Okuda, 2016). Siraj (2008) further argues that studies on War and Peace Journalism suggest that the discursive construction of conflicts by mass media has always been a serious concern of combatants, academics, media professionals as well as common people. 'Media

coverage shapes the course of events in war and peace' (Siraj, 2008). Therefore, media can be a frightful weapon of violence when they propagate messages of intolerance or misinformation that manipulate public sentiment (Ijaz, 2015), or can be an effective instrument for bolstering peace and mutual understating. However, Zaheer complains, 'research has found the media tilted towards aggression, violence, and disagreements during conflict coverage' (Zaheer, 2016). Power of the media's coverage may prove stronger than the will of people and government, consequently, making the media and press as an actor which might complicate the attempts to resolve the conflict' (Riaz, Ahmad, & Shah, 2018). Finally, Lee and Maslog (2005) were forced by the glaring findings of their study to announce that the media coverage of almost all Asian conflicts is dominated by war frames.

Dissecting the Attack

It will be prudent to analyze the Pulwama attack through the lenses of Louise Richardson's framework (2006) of the three 'R's. Richardson discusses in her incisive analysis the objective and motives of terrorist groups, andostensiblytells about different agendas working behind such attacks. She lays stress on understanding the very ideology behind such attacks and is of the view that they are motivated and driven by three 'R's i.e. Revenge, Renown and Reaction (Siyech, 2019).

Revenge: there are seemingly two motives behind the 'Revenge'; first, the suicide bomber carried out the attack in response to the humiliation and arrests in the past by the Indian security forces as told by his father in media talks (ibid). Revenge has remained a motivating factor for the terrorist groups to achieve their own goals, thereby paving way for further radicalization of individuals.

Renown: Being 'Renown', or the pursuit for recognition, is also motivating driving force behind terrorist attack like unpleasant incident of Pulwama.

Reaction: The reaction factor also carries the weight as in opinion of Richardson; the terrorist organizations expect large scale impact from their violent activities. The media of both the countries particularly Indian media least bother to discuss human rights violations, basic human rights, the perspective of the Kashmiris and liberty of the people being unpatriotic themes. Indeed as Richardson argues, the violent groups often hope for vicious repressive measures that will only increase the number of people who would likely join in anger and the violent groups can be from civilian as well as from the military sides in a conflict zone.

The distribution of themes and frames in selective press

This study uses framing as theoretical framework as the researcher is investigating themes and frames during Pulwama crisis. The categories of frames identified in the selective newspapers are as under:

- a. Distribution of themes
- b. Distribution of frames
- c. Relationship between themes and frames

a) The Distribution of Themes

Following four themes have been discussed in the content analysis to assess the framing of Pulwama attack in the selective press:

i. Revenge: The theme of revenge analyse data that portrays the sufferings of the Kashmiris at hands of the Indian security forces and IOJK in the selective newspapers.

- ii. Sacrifice: The theme of sacrifice represents the coverage of news items in the selective press that portray the sacrifice of Kashmiris for independence from the occupying forces of India through martyrdom and torture.
- iii. Kashmir cause: The theme of Kashmir cause represents the news items which highlight the Kashmir cause in the selective press which is still on the agenda of United Nations and Kashmiris are awaiting towards the global community for their fundamental right of freedom or plebiscite.
- iv. Pakistan's stance: The theme of Pakistan's stance discusses the news coverage in the selective press which gives the official narrative of Pakistan about the Kashmir.

b) Distribution of frames:

- i. Episodic Frames: The episodic frames covers the news related events that followed after the Pulwama attack and strained the relationship between India and Pakistan
- ii. Thematic Frames: The thematic frames covers the significance of the Kashmir problems and resolution of Kashmir conflict through intervention of third party or bilateral peace talks.

c) The Relationship between Themes and Frames

The relationship between themes and frames discusses and concludes the complexity of the issue and hard-line stance of Pakistan on the issue of Kashmir. It combines the overall data on themes and frames for impact analysis.

Research Questions

- R/Q: 1 what is the distribution of themes in the selected press?
- R/Q: 2 what is the distribution of frames in the selected press?
- R/Q: 3 what is the relationship between themes and frames during Pulwama attack?

Method

News coverage is far more than a benign source of facts (Gorvett, BBC, 2020). In this research study, the quantitative research method has been incorporated for the research design and gathering of numerical data was opted in order to provide solidified results that are backed by the empirical findingsto investigate the research questions. Going through different studies it has been learnt that as a methodological tool textual analysis remained widely used medium in the media framing of global affairs in the journalistic texts in the past (Golan & Carroll, 2012). To understand how the mainstream Pakistani English press covered the events on print journalism, a quantitative content analysis was conducted by examining news stories on the Pulwama event published on Dawn and The News—first an elite and the latter as a popular English daily from Pakistan. Content analysis directly examines news stories on Pulwama attack getting at the central aspect of the event. It allows quantitative operations and provides valuable insights over time through analysis of texts and news stories published between 15 February 2019 to 15 March 2019 when the issue remained a hot spot in both the countries (Krippendorff, 2013). To make the study more robust, the stories were selected from wellrespected news organizations with large number of readership. At the same time, the organizations were selected to represent diverse political beliefs and school of thoughts. In other words, a Criterion Sample (Cresswell and Clark, 2017) was used for this study—both news organizations are considered as liberal media.

Data

The corpus of the study consists of the news stories which appeared in Dawn and The News from February 15, 2019 to 15 March, 2019 discussing the events occurred after the terror attack. National newspaperstry to put news into a larger perspective for the reason that they are considered as more interpretative (Rosen, 2009, p. 2). Reese (2010) measures the domain of news framing which are roughly aligned with qualitative and quantitative orientations and that include "what" and "how". The perspective of "what" concentrates on the process of frame-building, while the "how" centers on the cognitive process of an individual. Thus it is an established fact that news stories play significant role in framing the public opinion.

Sampling

The relevant online editions of selective press were consulted to carry out research and data collection for a specific period spanning from 15 February 2019 to 15 March 2019, a propos content analysis. However, in some cases contents of the news stories were retrieved from the archives of these newspapers and the archives of National Library of Islamabad for further reading, accuracy, inferences, and cross-examination of data. The selective Newspapers' stories spanning from February 15, 2019, to March 15, 2019 when the tension diffuse a little after handing over the Indian pilot by Pakistan. The selection of the given newspapers has been made based on influence and popularity. The data for the Indo-Pak research is diverse in the Pakistani newspapers in the form of news stories. During this period, the selected newspapers published 231 news stories. The entire news stories were studied thoroughly alongwith their titles/ headlines. The text for the study from among these news stories are taken as an example for the representation of various actors, actions and sentiments.

Conceptual definitions of the indicators of Framing

Conceptual definitions of the indicators of News Framing by Media

There are different ways in which news media can perform, as it has a multidimensional concept. Furthermore, when it comes to audiences' expectations and perceived functions the particular type of mediastill matters, technically or organizationally (Hasebrink. Hölig, 2020 P. 293).

Operational Definition of News Framing by Media

Frame-building means the dynamics that sway the structural qualities of news frames. Factors inside journalism substantiate how news organizations and journalists frame issues (Shoemaker & Reese, 1996).

Frames in the new

Broad and narrow definitions suggest variety of descriptive interpretation of news frames. The theoretical and empirical contributions of broad and narrow definitions have the substance. Gitlin (1980, p. 7) defines frames as 'persistent patterns of cognition, interpretation, and presentation, of selection, emphasis and exclusion by which symbolhandlers routinely organize discourse.' Gamson and Modigliani (1989) refer to frames as 'interpretative packages' that give meaning to an issue.

Conceptual definition of diagnostic reporting

Diagnostic reporting is somewhat investigative type of reporting that covers the geopolitical, national, and humanitarian angles of the news. This type of reporting pays more meditation to analyzing its political context. For instance, it lays stress on explaining why and

what factors led to the crisis, instead of just narrating or filing the story as it is. (Shaw 2012, p96).

Operational definition of diagnostic reporting

A story is coded in this category if:

- i. Reporting which covers the critical reasons of the crises.
- ii. Diagnostic reporting try to find out peaceful ways to end.
- iii. Reporting which provides the solutions to avoid such crises in future.

Eventual Frames of the study

A suicide bomber identified as Adil Dar, a local resident of Indian held Kashmir smashed an explosive-laden car into 16-vehicle convoy of CRPF on Feb 14, 2019, a suicide bomber, killing more than 40 personnel in Kashmir's Pulwama district and causing injuries to 35 persons. The explosion was so powerful that it was felt in Srinagar, about 30 km away. Two vehicles, including the one carrying the bomber Adil Ahmad Dar, a local Kashmiri youth from the Pulwama district were blown into smithereens. In a video released on social media, the Jaish e Mohammad (JeM), claimed responsibility for the attack which has been deemed one of the deadliest attacks on Indian forces in decades (Ashiq, The Hindu, 2019). India blamed Pakistan for the attack, while the latter condemned the attack and denied having any connection to it (Qureshi, DAWN, 2019). The attack drew worldwide condemnations and strained the already fraught relations between India and Pakistan and consequently, almost precipitated a war between them. Moreover, the personnel killed in the attack belonged to various Indian states which created nationwide aggression and put pressure on the Indian Government for revengeful action against Pakistan. The killed personnel of Central Reserve Police Force (CRPF) belonged to the following Indian states (Deccan Herald, 2019).

Perpetrator: The perpetrator of this deadliest attack was identified as Adil Ahmad Dar, a 22 year local resident of Indian Occupied Jammu and Kashmir from Kakapura, District Pulwama (BBC, 2019). Giving details about the radicalization of the his son the parents of Adil Ahmad Dar told that he was humiliated and beaten by the police (Sharma, News 18, 2019). Adil Dar was arrested six times by the Indian authorities between September 2016 to March 2018 and released each time without any charges (Raina, Mumbai Mirror, 2019). However, the Indian Government after claim of JeM, a Pakistan based militant organization directly held Pakistan responsible for the attack.

Investigation: The National Investigation Agency, a counter-terrorist task force in India dispatched a 12 member team to probe the attack working with the Jammu and Kashmir Police (BBC, 2019). Initial investigations suggested the car was carrying more than 300 kilograms (660 lb) of explosives, (The Times of India, 2019) including 80 kilograms (180 lb) of <u>RDX</u>, a <u>high explosive</u>, and <u>ammonium nitrate</u> (Sharma, 2019). Lt. General Hooda,said that the explosives might have been stolen from a construction site. He initially said that it was not possible that they were smuggled from across the border, but later said that he could not rule it out (The New York Times, Abi-Habib, Yasir, Kumar, 2019).

Never ending cycle of blame games

Unfortunately, the cause of the violence has been ignored and there are no joint engagements for the resolution of the conflict instead this has become a never-ending cycle of denials, rebuttals and blame between the two countries. Pakistan being the potential party of the conflict extends moral, political, moral and diplomatic support to the Kashmiris. There have

been several attempts for peace talks but no flexibility has been shown by Delhi which thinks that Kashmir is its integral part and that the UN resolutions for plebiscite in Kashmir have become obsolete. (Dawn, 16 Feb 2019). India has never provided solid evidence that non-state actors used this country's soil to target others for any fruitful investigations because it is unlikely that a solution will be found without such cooperation. Pakistan's stance is that resistence is within Kashmir and that the young suicide bomber in the Pulwama attack was a native of IHK. Kashmiris have been disappointed by the global community and for grant of their legitimate right to them. The matter has reached to the point that now the young Kashmiris are taking up the gun and attacking symbols of the Indian establishment in anger and frustration. The weaponry of occupying forces and hail of bullets have failed to deter their way towards freedom from the Indian occupation. Because they see no other way to resist the atrocities unleashed by the Indian military machine there have been several instances of intellectuals, students, people from academia for choosing the path of armed struggle against Indian security forces (Dawn. 2019).

Results and Date Analysis

A quantitative content analysis was conducted to investigate the framing influence in the selective media i.e The News and Dawn, leading English dailies of Pakistan to discover the prevailing themes employed during the Pulwama conflict. Distribution of themes was the first research question addressed to configure the framing element about Pulwama attack. Secondly, this research examined the influence of attributes of episodic and thematic frames. Thirdly, relationships between themes and frames were investigated for further assessment of framing. To find the answer to this query, Rank Order was used through observing the frequencies of attributes over designated time for content analysis and the results were collected through systematic coding of time, topics, attributes, and media platforms. This chapter represents various correlations of the time frame of Pulwama issue with autocorrelation, synchronized correlation, and cross-lagged correlations between and within two media sources. One phase discusses the situation arising from the Pulwama crisis and the other discusses the Indian surgical strike into the territory of Pakistan resulting in the capture and release of Indian Air Force pilot Wing Commander Abhinandan Varthaman by Pakistani authorities. The results were generated on the SPSS for both the correlations and attribute frequencies. The two cross-lagged correlation values for the three hypotheses were compared to assess the influence of framing on the selective newspapers in the context of Pulwama crisis. The baseline value was then calculated using the correlation values and compared with the cross-lag correlations to see if framing effect had taken place as hypothesized. For the attribute's frequencies, the Rank Order was observed to determine if there was a transfer of attributes agendas (if any) of both the selective newspapers. The following tables represent the results obtained as mentioned.

Distribution of Themes and Frames

Table-1
Distribution of the themes

Newspaper	Revenge	Sacrifice	Kashmir	Pakistan	Total
			cause	stance	
Dawn	12	19	23	7	61
The News	16	11	37	18	82
Total	28	30	60	25	143

Journal of Peace, Development and Communication Volume 08 Issue 02

Table-2
Distribution of the frames

Newspaper	Episodic frames	Thematic frames	Total
Dawn	23	11	34
The News	41	13	54
Total	64	24	88

Table-3
Relationship between Themes and Frames

Frames	Revenge	Sacrifice	Kashmir	Pakistan	Total
			cause	stance	
Episodic	32	46	52	26	156
Thematic	16	15	26	18	75
Total	48	61	78	44	231

This study uses framing as theoretical framework as the researcher is investigating themes and frames during the Pulwama crisis.

Data Result and Analysis

A quantitative content analysis was carried out to investigate the themes and frames in the selected press during Pulwama crisis in which framing theory has been employed as theoretical framework for this study.

R/Q:1 What is the distribution of themes in the selected press?

Table-1
Distribution of the themes

Newspaper	Revenge	Sacrifice	Kashmir	Pakistan	Total
			cause	stance	
Dawn	12 (19.67%)	19 (31.14%)	23 (37.70%)	7 (11.47%)	61 (100%)
The News	16 (19.51%)	11 (13.41%)	37 (45.12%)	18 (21.95%)	82 (100%)
Total	28 (19.58%)	30 (20.97%)	60 (41.95%)	25 (17.48%)	143 (100%)

Table 1 shows that a total of 143 stories were recorded in two selected newspapers regarding Pulwama crisis in the Indian occupied Jammu and Kashmir (IOJK) having revenge, sacrifice, Kashmir cause and the theme with Pakistan's stance on the issue. Out of 143 stories 19.58% were reported in the context of revenge element, 20.97% stories reported in the context of sacrifice element and 41.95% stories portrayed Kashmir cause whereas 17.48% stories gave the Pakistan's stance on the issue of Kashmir. If we talk about the selected newspaper separately Dawn published total 61 stories and The News published 90 stories on Pulwama crisis on the themes prescribed in table 1. To bifurcate these stories with each theme we find that 19.67% stories of Dawn newspaper framed the revenge element in comparison with The News which had the proportion of 19.51% in the same context. As for as the theme of sacrifice is concerned Dawn reported 31.14% of its stories in comparison with The News which reported the sacrifice theme with 13.41% ratio. The theme of Kashmir cause formed 37.70% in Dawn in comparison with the 45.12% covered by The News. As for as coverage of Pakistan's stance on Kashmir is concerned Dawn published 11.47% of its stories on this theme in comparison with The News which published 21.95% content on the same. These figures clearly show that the theme of Kashmir cause remained a dominant frame in coverage of both the newspaper followed by the sacrifice element regarding Kashmir conflict whereas minimum coverage was allocated to the Pakistan's stance on Kashmir issue as per the combined statistics of both the newspapers.

R/Q :2 What is the distribution of frames in the selected press? Table-2

Newspaper	Episodic frames	Thematic frames	Total
Dawn	23 (67.64%)	11 (32.35%)	34 (100%)
The News	41 (75.92%)	13 (24.07%)	54 (100%)
Total	64 (72.72%)	24 (27.27%)	88 (100%)

Distribution of the frames

Table 2 shows that a total number of 88 stories were recorded in the context of episodic frames and thematic frames in the selected press. In order to gauge the percentage we find that both the selective newspapers gave a proportion of 72.72 percent to episodic frames whereas 27.27 to the thematic frames. To bifurcate the results from the selective press we further find that Dawn gave 67.64% of its total coverage of the crisis to the episodic frames in comparison with The News which gave 75.92% to the episodic frames. As for as distribution of thematic frames is concerned Dawn gave 32.35% weightage to the thematic frames in comparison to The News which gave 24.07% weightage to this frame. As a matter of fact episodic frames found more space than thematic frames in the coverage of the crisis in both the newspaper. The News which has been part of the campaign of "Amanki Asha" (The aspiration for peace), a joint venture of The Jang Group of Pakistan and The Times of India published 54 stories in comparison with Dawn which published 34 stories on these frames being more stalwart than Dawn during coverage of the crisis. However, episodic frames remained dominant during the crisis in both the newspapers with a variable difference.

R/Q: 3 what is the relationship between themes and frames during Pulwama attack?

Table-3

Relationship Between Themes and Frames

Frames	Revenge	Sacrifice	Kashmir	Pakistan	Total
			cause	stance	
Episodic	32 (20.51%)	46 (29.48%)	52 (33.33%)	26 (16.66%)	156 (100%)
Thematic	16 (21.33%)	15 (20%)	26 (34.66%)	18 (24%)	75 (100%)
Total	48 (22.77%)	61 (26.40%)	78 (33.76%)	44 (19.04%)	231 (100%)

Table 3 shows the relationship between themes and frames and depicts out that a total number of 231 stories were reported during the crisis with a total sum of 156 stories on the episodic frames and 75 stories on thematic frames. The results show that Kashmir cause has been concentrated more vigorously in these themes and frames with 33.76% allocation followed by the sacrifice theme and frame with 26.40% during the crisis. The revenge factor behind the Pulwama attack found 22.77% coverage and Pakistan stand on the issue found minimum coverage in the whole episode of Pulwama crisis amounting to a total of 19% coverage.

Finding and Analysis

The inductive framing analysis revealed that there were meaningful differences in the framing of the Kashmir issuein thestories of The News and Dawn. A total number of 231 stories

were reported in both the newspapers on all the frames and themes from 15 February 2019 to 15 March 2019 out of which 95 stories were published by Dawn stories with a ratio of 41.12% whereas 136 were reported by The News with a proportion of 58.87%. Although both the newspapers published significant number of news stories on the post-Pulwama events, the frames used by both newspapers differed significantly over the Kashmir, its causes and responsibility and solution to the issue. The analysis found one major distinctive frame used by the selected newspapers pertinent to the Kashmir issue. Both the newspapers framed the Kashmir issue predominantly as an unfinished agenda of the partition of subcontinent as well as human rights issue. These frames are discussed in more details in the following section.

Discussion

The study found that the Framing theory of Erving Goffman has significance influence on Media. The communication manipulates the things in favor of ruling elite of dominant class and Media normally remains patriotic in national issues. The national narrative overlaps the truth. It was found that Kashmir cause is more dominant in the selected newspapers of Pakistan and the selective press had more tilt towards episodic frames than thematic frames. Derived from the review of existing literature the problem identified addressed the question of the influence of framing in the selective press. It also aimed at finding whether or not the power of media extends beyond the parameters of framing influence and holds the capacity of transferring attributes as well. This study attempted to bridge the gap concerning the need for investigating the framing power of Pakistani English press. The results have also depicted out that inevitably the frames do not stand against or exclude each other. Rather the frames could blend from one to another as well. One feature is common among both the newspapers, the dominant frame The News and Dawn used vis-à-vis the Pulwamaunrest was Kashmir cause with Pakistan as a stake holder in its resolution. Both the newspapers published news stories pertinent to the post-Pulwama unrest in Kashmir and declared the India killing of Kasmiris as a war against the people in Indian-held Kashmir. The analysis revealed that The News and Dawn in their news stories discourses condemned the 'Indian brutalities' in the Kashmir valley and portrayed the Kashmir issue as an unfinished agenda of the division of sub-continent. The current inhospitality of New Delhi's security forces as suggested by these framing devices is very much anindigenous Kashmir phenomenon, while India's harsh treatment of Kashmiris is helping create a new generation of militants, such as the late Burhan Wani and Adil Dar. The frames and themes occurring in the news stories of the selective press build a narrative regarding the Pulwama issue as a result of revenge coupled with the element of sacrifice and human rights violation in Kashmir by India. The perception of Kashmir issue is seen from the varied angle in both the countries as it is framed differently in both the countries with respect to their national narratives. The academic perspective of the 'news' implies that agents in the society coupled with many social agencies have dominating role in constructing the images and perceptions (Archetti, 2010). Media houses are influential to present the foreign events in such a way which the audience may not experience personally if not reported in the media (Soroka, 2003). A cursory look at the choices of frames and themes unveils the significant differences between the two newspapers and that is the number of the stories highlighting different frames on the conflict published during the selective time frame from February 2019 to Mrch 2019 with The News publishing 136 stories and Dawn to publish 95 stories on the crisis. In addition to this, with the most of the stories in The News and Dawn holding India responsible for the unrest and unresolved issue of Kashmir and poor treatment of the Kashmiris; a realist approach has also been reflected by The News and Dawn mentioning that since the international community has lost its interests, Kashmir issue can only be solved bilaterally between India and Pakistan. The overall sense of the discourse is that India is violating human rights in Kashmir and the issue can only be resolved if India changes its attitude and listens to the alienated people of Kashmir. At the same time The News and Dawn were also critical about Pakistan for not controlling the banned militant organizations that have put the Kashmir cause in danger.

Conclusion

Based on the above-given results, it is concluded that media discourse on the issue of Kashmir in both Indian and Pakistani media is tilted more to framing as well as war journalism. The results substantiate other studies using similar theoretical model (Lee &Maslog 2005; Shinar, 2004). However, keeping in view analyses of the similar studies related to Indo-Pak conflict, we can also conclude that as compared to Pakistani media, the Indian media are more war-oriented and jingoistic. Such findings are in line with those of Wolfsfeld(2004) and Fawcett (2002).

Recommendations

There is dire need for Pakistan and India to move forward in positive direction and adopt win-win approach to deal with the conflicting issues. As the both governments are believed to have strong support of their respective military establishments, it is the high time for the current Imran Khan and Narendra Modi-led governments in Pakistan and India to augment confidence and take concrete steps to restore the spirit of the Lahore peace process and to initiate the Composite Dialogue process in order to resolve thorny issues which has constrained progress and prosperity in South Asia. It is a considered that both the leaders have strong support of their establishments which should be utilized for better relationship between both the countries. Pakistan should make all possible measures to restrict the intervention of its non-state actors which create differences between the two neighboring states and discourage the aptitudes of militancy among the Kashmiri youth. Pakistan and India should jointly work for the betterment of Kashmiri people through transit trade, bus services, and opening of meeting corridors on the line of control similar as to the pattern of Kartarpura corridor for the Sikh Diaspora and by creating tourism based socio-economic, sports and cultural opportunities shunning away all foreign intercession in the region. For sustainability of peace in South Asia and to beat the growing menace of poverty in the region, both Pakistan and India should go for out of the box approach to settle their bilateral issues. All the parties of conflict need to accommodate each other by adopting win-win approach and projects like 'Amanki Asha' should be encouraged at media platforms of both the countries for acceleration of normalcy in the region. Further, a news story should be treated as a news story and not a verdict on a particular issue. Experts such as Rao (2019) have argued that there is a growing driftto manipulate the news consumer through words applied in journalistic practices. In this way, a willful attempt is made to create atmosphere hatred amongst the countrymen. This mind-set of the news organizations must be curtailed because seeding of such prejudices creates lots of misapprehensions on part of the masses (Feyaz, 2019), dividing the segments of a society. In this regard, the opinion leaders like politicians too have an urgent and added liability to prevent both the transmission of rumors and rabble-rousing (Siyech, 2019). Furthermore, now a days

social media is considered as more powerful medium in influencing public opinion than the traditional media and during the Pulwama crisis it was learnt that different hash tags were employed by people of both India and Pakistan related to Pulwama attack to criticize each other. It is strongly recommended for the scholars to work out the framing of Pulwama issue on social media particularly framing of the issue on the Twitter platform.

References

- Abi-Habib, Maria. Yasir, Samir and Kumar, Hari 15 February, 2019, India blames Pakistan for attack in Kashmir, promising a response, https://www.nytimes.com/2019/02/15/world/asia/kashmir-attack-pulwama.html
- Ajzen and Fishbein's (1980) theory of reasoned action as applied to moral behavior: A confirmatory analysis. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 62(1), 98–109. https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-3514.62.1.98
- Ajzen I, Fishbein M. 1980. Understanding Attitudes and Predicting Social Behavior. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall
- Alasuutari, P., Qadir, A., &Creutz, K. (2013). The domestication of foreign news: news stories related to the 2011 Egyptian revolution in British, Finnish and Pakistani newspapers. Media, Culture & Society, 35 (6), 692-707.
- Aljazeera . Protests erupt as India troops kill Kashmir fighters. 08 06, 2017. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2017/08/protests-erupt-indiatroops-kill-kashmir-rebels-170805075259981.html (accessed 02, 26, 2019).
- AlJazeera 19 February 2019. India demands Pakistan take 'credible action' over Kashmir attack, https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/2/19/india-demands-pakistan-take-credible-action-over-kashmir-attack
- Allan, S & Zelizer, B (2004), Journalism and War, in Allan, S & Zelizer, B (eds) Reporting War: Journalism in Wartime, Oxford: Routledge
- Altschull, J.H. (1995). Agents of power: The role of the news media in human affairs. New York: Longman.
- Archetti, C. (2010). Comparing international coverage of 9/11: Towards an interdisciplinary explanation of the construction of news. Journalism, 11 (5), 567-588. BBC (September 5, 2016. Viewpoint: Why mass funeral spur violence in Kashmir.Retrieved from: http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india- 37227943, Accessed on September 20, 2016.
- Archetti, C. (2010). Comparing international coverage of 9/11: Towards an interdisciplinary explanation of the construction of news. Journalism, 11 (5), 567-588. BBC (September 5, 2016. Viewpoint: Why mass funeral spur violence in Kashmir.Retrieved from: http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india- 37227943, Accessed on September 20, 2016.
- Ashiq, Peerzada, 37 CRPF men killed in J&K suicide attack, The Hindu, February 15, 2019, https://www.thehindu.com/news/national/ied-blast-in-kashmirs-pulwama-many-crpf-jawans-killed/article26268289.ece
- Atran, Scott. 2003. Genesis of Suicide Terrorism. Social Science Review 299: 1534–39.
- Ayoob, *Mohammed.* (an Indian-American political scientist), *Tragedy of Errors*, 03 April, 2018, The Hindu.
- Bagdikian B (2005) Grand theft: the conglomeratization of media and degradation of culture, multinational monitor 26(1-2): 35-37.
- Bajpai, Kanti., Basit, Saira., Krishnappa, V. (2014), India's Grand Strategy: History, Theory, Cases Published by Routledge, Taylor and Francis Group, New Delhi, India.
- Bar-Tal, D (1998), Societal Beliefs in Times of Intractable Conflict: The Israeli Case, International Journal of Conflict Management, 9, p22-50

- <u>Bateson, M.C.</u> (2004) [1972]. Our Own Metaphor: A Personal Account of a Conference on the Effects of Conscious Purpose on Human Adaptation. Hampton Press.
- BBC 15 February 2019, Pulwama Attack: India will 'completely isolate' Pakistan, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-47249133
- BBC, 26 February 2019: Balakot: India launches air strike in Pakistan, https://www.bbc.com/news/av/world-asia-47379558
- Bercovitch, J & DeRouen, K (2004), Mediation in Internationalized Ethnic Conflicts: Assessing the Determinants of a Successful Process, Armed Forces and Society, 30, 2004, p147-170
- Bovee, W G (1999), Discovering Journalism, Westport: Greenwood Press
- Brewer, R. Paul (2003), The Shifting Foundations of Public Opinion about Gay Rights, <u>Journal</u> of Politics
- Bülbül, Küdret (2019). Keşmir: Dinmeyenacı. TRT Ses, Ankara, Türkiye.
- Burki, S. J. (2007). Kashmir: A Problem in Search of a Solution. Washington DC: United States Institute of Peace.
- Business Standard, 14 February 2019, Pulwama terror attack: Rajnath Singh assures strong response, https://www.business-standard.com/article/news-ani/pulwama-terror-attack-rajnath-singh-assures-strong-response-119021401336_1.html
- Carruthers, S (2000), The Media at War: Communication and Conflict in the Twentieth Century, London: Macmillan
- Carter, Michael. J, (2013) The Hermeneutics of Frames and Framing: An Examination of the Media's Construction of Reality (P.1), SAGE Open April-June 2013: 1–12 © The Author(s) 2013 DOI: 10.1177/2158244013487915 sgo.sagepub.com
- Chan, M. (2012). The discursive reproduction of ideologies and national identities in the Chinese and Japanese English language press. Discourse & Communication,6(4), 361-378.
- Chan, M. (2012). The discursive reproduction of ideologies and national identities in the Chinese and Japanese English language press. Discourse & Communication, 6(4), 361-378.
- Chang, Tsan-kuo. 1998. "All Countries Not Created Equal to Be News: World System and International Communication." Communication Research 25 (5): 528–563. doi:10.1177/009365098025005004
- Chirs Ogden, Indian foreign policy: Ambition and Transition (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2014), P.43.
- Clausewitz, C V (2004), On War, Barnes and Noble: New York
- CNN News18: June 02, 2016 No Evidence of Pakistan Govt Hand in Pathankot Attack: DG NIA, https://www.news18.com/news/india/no-evidence-of-pakistan-govt-hand-in-pathankot-attack-dg-nia-1251256.html
- Cohen, B (1963), The Press and Foreign Policy, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press
- Cohen, B.C. (1973). The Public's Impact on Foreign Policy. Boston: Little, Brown.
- Cohen, Stephen Philip (2001). India, Pakistan and Kashmir by, The Brookings Institution, presented at University of Texas, December 2001 revised version forthcoming in the Journal of Strategic Studies, 2003
- Cottle,S (2006), Mediatized Conflict, Berkshire: Open University Press

- Cutter, A G (1999), Journalists: Must They Remain Neutral in Conflict?, United Nations Chronicle, XXXVI, www.un.org/Pubs/chronicle/1999/issue2/0299p29.htm
- Das, Shaswati. Mint 15 February 2019. India will completely isolate Pakistan, says Arun Jaitley, https://www.livemint.com/news/india/pulwama-terror-attack-india-will-completely-isolate-pakistan-says-arun-jaitley-1550209291458.html
- Dawn, 16 February 2019. On Kashmir attack, Shah Mahmood Qureshi says 'violence is not the govt's policy'". https://www.dawn.com/news/1464205
- Dawn, 22 February 2019 <u>India rejects Imran's offer, seeks action against perpetrators https://www.dawn.com/news/1464867</u>
- DAWN, February 16, 2019, on Kashmir attack Shah Mehmood Qureshi says 'violence is not the govt's policy'. https://www.dawn.com/news/1464205
- Dearing, J W & Rogers, E (1996), Agenda-setting, London: Sage
- Deccan Herald (February 15, 2019) https://www.deccanherald.com/national/pulwama-attack-how-you-can-718620.html
- Delinic, Tomislav., Pandey, Nishchal N. (2012) SAARC: Towards Meaningful Cooperation. Published by Centre for South Asian Studies (CSAS) www.csas.org.np Konrad Adenauer Stiftung (KAS), Printed at: Modern Printing Press Kathmandu, Nepal
- Dennis Chong and James N. Druckman (2007), Framing Theory, P, (104), Annu. Rev. Polit. Sci. 2007. 10:103–26 doi: 10.1146/annurev.polisci.10.072805.103054
- Druckman, James N. (2001), THE IMPLICATIONS OF FRAMING EFFECTS FOR CITIZEN COMPETENCE, Political Behavior, Vol. 23, No. 3, September 2001 (2002)
- Duhe, S. F., & Zoch, L. M. (1994). A case study—Framing the media's agenda during a crisis. Public Relations Quarterly, 39, 42.
- <u>Eli Avraham, Anat First</u> (2010), Combining the representation approach with the framing concept: Television news coverage of the Arab population in Israel during conflict First Published August 17, 2010 Other, https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884910367594
- Enelow & Hinich (1984), The Spatial Theory of Voting: An Introduction, Cambridge University Press
- Entman, R. (1993). Framing toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. Journal of Communication, 10, 155-173.
- Entman, R.M. (2003). Framing: Toward a clarification of a fractured paradigm. Journal of Communication, 43 (4), 51-57.
- Erin Blakemore, The Kashmir Conflict: How did it start? National Geographic, Published March 3, 2019, https://www.nationalgeographic.com/culture/article/kashmir-conflict-how-did-it-start
- Ersoy, 2020. Asia pacific, Karachi, Pakistan https://www.aa.com.tr/en/asia-pacific/pakistan-wants-united-stance-on-kashmir-palestine/1887626
- Fahmy, Shahira. 2007. "They Took It Down": Exploring Determinants of Visual Reporting in the Toppling of the Saddam Statue in National and International Newspapers." Mass Communication & Society 10 (2): 143–170. doi:10.1080/15205430701265638.
- Fairhurst, G., & Sarr, R. (1996). The art of framing. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Farhad Safi, Bahire Efe Ozad, Liaqat Iqbal (2020). Ideological representation in the Indian Newspapers 's editorials: A case study of Pulwama incident in Kashmir, Revista Argentina de Clinica Psicologica, 2020 Vol xxix N 3 743-754

- Farooq, Shumaila. Gul, Salma (2020). From the Pulwama to Indian revocation of Article 370 in Indian held Kashmir: Policy implications on the geopolitics of South Asia, Global Legal Studies Review (GLSR) URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/glsr.2020(V-I).02
- Fawcett, L. (2002). WhyPeace Journalism Isn't News? Journalism Studies, 3(2), 213-223.
- Feyyaz, Muhammad. Contextualizing the Pulwama Attack in Kashmir A Perspective from Pakistan, April 2019, Vol. 13, No. 2 (April 2019), pp. 69-74 Published by: Terrorism Research Initiative Stable URL: https://www.jstor.org/stable/26626867
- Finney, M (2003), Good Embed: How the U.S. Military Improved Favorability of Coverage Through Embedding Journalists, paper presented at the International Communication Association, 2005 Annual Meeting, New York
- Gadda, D. N. (2014). 'Partial Journalism'—A Study of National Media of India and Kashmir. Trends in Information Management, 13(1), 13-23.
- Gamson, W. A. (1989). News as framing: Comments on Graber. American behavioral scientist, 33(2), 157-161.
- Gamson, W. A., & Modigliani, A. (1989). Media discourse and public opinion on nuclear power: A constructionist approach. American Journal of Sociology, 95, 1–37
- Gill, Paul. A Multi-Dimensional Approach to Suicide Bombing, School of Politics and International Relations, University College Dublin, Ireland, International Journal of conflict and violence, urn: nbn: de: 0070-ijcv-2007246, IJ C V: Vol. 1 (2) 2007, pp. 142 159
- Gitlin, T. (1980). The whole world is watching. Berkeley: University of California Press
- Glasser, T L (1992), Objectivity and News Bias, in Cohen, D (ed), Philosophical Issues in Journalism, Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Gorvett , Zaria. 12th May 2020 https://www.bbc.com/future/article/20200512-how-the-news-changes-the-way-we-think-and-behave
- Haas, M (1974), International Conflict, Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill
- Habermas, J (1989), The structural transformation of the public sphere: an inquiry into a category of bourgeois society, Cambridge: Polity
- Hajni, Mehraj. The Kashmir Conflict: A Kashmiri Perspective https://www.ideals.illinois.edu/bitstream/handle/2142/15469/The_Kashmir_Conflict_A_Kashmiri_Perspective.pdf?sequence=2&isAllowed=y
- Hallahan, K. (2008). Strategic framing. The International Encyclopedia of Communication.
- Hallahan, Kirk (1999) Seven Models of Framing: Implications for Public Relations, (P. 207) JOURNAL OF PUBLIC RELATIONS RESEARCH, 11(3), 205–242 Copyright © 1999, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.
- Hanitzsch, T (2004), Journalists as peacekeeping force? Peace Journalism and Mass Communication Theory, Journalism Studies, 5 (4), p483-495
- Hasebrink, Uwe. Hölig, Sascha. (2020). Audience-Based Indicators for News Media Performance: A Conceptual Framework and Findings from Germany. Media and Communication (ISSN: 2183–2439) 2020, Volume 8, Issue 3, Pages 293–303 DOI: 10.17645/mac.v8i3.3191. Leibniz Institute for Media Research | Hans-Bredow-Institut, 20148 Hamburg, Germany; https://www.hans-bredow-institut.de/uploads/media/default/cms/media/s62n5lb_Hasebrink_H%C3%B6lig_202 0 Audience-Based%20Indicators.pdf

- Herman, Edward, and Noam Chomsky. Manufacturing Consent: The political economy of the mass media. London: Vintage, 1994.
- Hickman, J & Barlett, S (2002), _Reporting a New Delhi Bias? A Content Analysis of AP Wire Stories on the Conflicts in Sri Lanka and Kashmir', Jovert 6 (3), http://social.chass.ncsu.edu/jouvert/v613/sri.htm last accessed on October 31, 2007
- Iggers, J (1999), Good News, Bad News: Journalism Ethics and the Public Interest, Oxford: Westview Press
- Ijaz, H. (2015). News Framing on Indo-Pak Conflicts in the News (Pakistan) and Times of India: War and Peace Journalism Perspective. Mass Communication & Journalism, 5(8).
- India Today, 15 February 2019. US condemns Pulwama terror attack, asks Pakistan to deny support to terrorists. https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/us-condemns-pulwama-terror-attack-asks-pakistan-to-deny-support-to-terrorists-1456635-2019-02-15
- IPCM, DATA. "2019 Ceasefire Violations Data." Indo-Pak Conflict Monitor. http://indopakconflictmonitor.org/yearwise_cfv.php?year=2019
- Islam, Md. Nazmul, "Before and After Pulwama: The Kashmir Issue", 05.03.2019, INSAMER.
- Iyengar, S & Peters, M D, and Kinder D R (1982), Experimental Demonstrations of the —Not-So-Minimal Consequences of Television News Programs, The American Political Science Review, 76 (4) p848-858
- Iyengar, S. (1987). Television News and Citizens' Explanation of National Affairs. The American Political Science Review, 81 (3), 815-832.
- Jacob, Jayanth, and Aurangzeb Naqshbandi. 41,000 deaths in 27 years: The anatomy of Kashmir militancy in numbers . 09 25, 2017. https://www.hindustantimes.com/indianews/the-anatomy-of-kashmirmilitancy-in-numbers/story-UncrzPTGhN22Uf1HHe64JJ.html (accessed 08 18, 2018).
- Jacoby WG. 2000. Issue framing and public opinion on government spending. Am. J. Polit. Sci. 44:750–67
- Jammu Kashmir Coalition of Civil Society Report (2018) https://jkccs.net/
- Jan, Mirza. Khan, Muhammad Rashid (2011). Peace Journalism and Conflict Reporting: The Case of Pakistani Media, South Asian Studies A Research Journal of South Asian Studies Vol. 26, No. 2, July December 2011, 311-324
- Jaspal , Zafar Nawaz India's Surgical Strike' Stratagem Brinkmanship and Response, Pages: 234, Publishers: Khursheed Printers (Pvt) Ltd 2019
- Jaspal, Zafar Nawaz, India's Surgical Strike' Stratagem Brinkmanship and Response Pages: 234, Publishers: Khursheed Printers (Pvt) Ltd 2019
- Jaspal, Zafar Nawz (2019). India's Surgical Strike' Stratagem, Brinksmanship and Response Pages: 234, Publishers: Khursheed Printers (Pvt) Ltd 2019
- <u>Joanna Slater</u>, October, 04, 2019 https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/asia_pacific/ussenator-blocked-from-visiting-kashmir-as-crackdown-enters-third-month/2019/10/04/63790b18-e6bf-11e9-b0a6-3d03721b85ef_story.html
- <u>Jones, Peter (1994)</u>, Bearing the Consequences of Beliefs, the Journal of Political Philosophy Joseph, T. (2000). Kashmir, human rights and the Indian press. Contemporary South Asia, 9(1), 41-55.

- **Joshi, Shashank** (2016) BBC 07 January, 2016: Pathankot attack: India-Pakistan peace talks derailed? https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-35240272
- Kashmir's 69-year-long history of deadly strife. 08 17, 2016. https://www.dawn.com/news/1278128 (accessed 09 12, 2018).
- Kellner, D (1992), The Persian Gulf TV War, Oxford: Westview Press
- Khalid, W. (2016). Media Propaganda and the Kashmir Dispute: A Case Study of the Kashmir Floods. Report, Thomson Reuters Foundation, UK, August.
- Khan, Ajmal. Khan, Azmat (2020). From Burhan Wani to Abhi Nandan: A Comparative Analysis of India and Pakistan's Newspaper Coverage of Kashmir Conflict. NUST Journal of International Peace & Stability 2020, Vol. III (1) Pages 41-58 njips.nust.edu.pk
- Kinder, Donald R, Sanders, M. Lynn (1996), Divided by Color: Racial Politics and Democratic Ideals, The University of Chicago Press
- Koul, S. Human Rights of Journalists Working in Kashmir: An In-depth Analysis
- Lamb, Alastair (1991). Kashmir a Disputed Legacy 1846-1990. Oxford Press.
- Latif, F., Siddiqua, A., & Iftikhar, U. (2020). Escalation in Kashmir Conflict after Burhan Wani's Killing: A Comparative Study of the Coverage by Pakistani and Indian Press. sjesr, 3(2), 83-90. DOI: https://doi.org/10.36902/sjesr-vol3-iss2-2020(83-90)
- Lee, S. T., & Maslog, C. C. (2005). War or Peace Journalism? Asian Newspaper Coverage of Conflicts. Journal of Communication, 55(2), 311–329.
- Lee, S.T. & Maslog, C. C.(2005). War or peace journalism? Asian newspaper coverage of conflicts. Journal of Communication 55(2), 311-329. Retrieved from https://academic.oup.com/joc/ article-abstract/55/2/311/4102995?redirectedFrom=fulltext
- Lippmann, W (1922), Public Opinion, New York: Macmillan
- MacArthur, J R (1993), Second Front: Censorship and Propaganda in the Gulf War, Berkley: University of California Press
- Mander, Jerry. (1978). Four Arguments for the Elimination of Television. New York: William Morrow
- Maxwell E. McCombs & Donald L. Shaw. The Emergence of American Political Issues: The Agenda-Setting Function of the Press. (West Publishing Co., 1977).
- McCombs, M., & Shaw, D L (1972), The Agenda-Setting Function of Mass Media, Public Opinion Quarterly, 36 (Summer), p176-187
- McNair, B (1988), Images of the enemy: Reporting the new cold war, London: Routledge MHA Annual Report 2016-2017.
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Pakistan (2019), Pakistan shares its preliminary findings on Pulwama paper, http://mofa.gov.pk/pakistan-shares-its-preliminary-findings-on-pulwama-paper/
- Mitchell, C R (1981). The structure of international conflict. London: Macmillan.
- Monitoring Report, The News 17 February 2019: Pulwama attack: India hikes 200 pc Customs duty on Pak goods, https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/433087-pulwama-attack-india-hikes-200-pc-customs-duty-on-pak-goods
- Nanninga, Pieter. Islam and Suicide Attacks, Rijksuniversiteit Groningen, The Netherlands, Cambridge elements, Series: Elements in Religion and Violence, DOI:

- https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108670524 Publisher: Cambridge University Press Online publication date: October 2019, Online ISBN: 9781108670524
- Nelson, E. <u>Thomas (1997)</u>, Media Framing of A Civil Liberties Conflict and Its Effect on Tolerance, American Political Science Association · September 1997
- Nelson, E. <u>Thomas.</u> Oxley, M. <u>Zoe (1999)</u>, <u>Issue Framing Effects on Belief Importance and Opinion</u>, <u>The Journal of Politics</u>, <u>Volume 61</u>, <u>Number 4Nov.</u>, <u>1999</u>The University of Chicago Press Journals
- No normalcy in Kashmir, says women's fact-finding team. The Hindu, September 24, 2019. https://www.thehindu.com/news/national/no-normalcy-in-kashmir-says-womens-fact-finding-team/article29502396.ece
- Okuda, H. (2016). China's "peaceful rise /peaceful development": A case study of media frames of the rise of China. Global Media and China, 1(2).121-138.
- Pan, Z., & Kosicki, G. M. (1993). Framing analysis: An approach to news discourse. Political communication, 10(1), 55-75
- Pape Robert, Dying to win: The strategic logic of the suicide terrorist, Random House, 2005, Pages 352, ISBN 1-4000-6317-5, Published online by Cambridge University Press: 27 August 2003
- Paul, T.V. 2005, (Edited by) The India-Pakistan conflict—an enduring rivalry, Cambridge University Press, Chapter 1, Causes of the India–Pakistan enduring Rivalry
- Peleg, S. (2006). Peace Journalism through the Lens of Conflict Theory: Analysis and Practice. Conflict & Communication Online, 5(2), 1-17.
- Philo, G & MacLaughlin, G (1995), The British Media and the Gulf War, in Philo, G (ed), Glasgow Media Group Reader, Volume 2: Industry, Economy, War and Politics, London: Routledge, p146-156
- Powlick, P.J. (1995). Sources of Public Opinion for American Foreign Policy Officials, International Studies Quarterly, 39 (4), 427-451.
- Press Trust of India (PTI), NDTV, 15 February 2019. UN Chief Condemns Pulwama Terror Attack, https://www.ndtv.com/india-news/un-secretary-general-antonio-guterres-condemns-pulwama-terror-attack-1993835
- PTI, The Week, 15 February 2019. US asks Pak to stop supporting terrorists, suspects ISI behind Pulwama. https://www.theweek.in/news/world/2019/02/15/us-asks-pak-to-stop-supporting-terrorists-suspects-isi-behind-pulwama.html
- Raina, Anil. Mumbai Mirror February 17, 2019: Pulwama bomber was detained six times in less than two years, https://mumbaimirror.indiatimes.com/mumbai/cover-story/pulwama-bomber-was-detained-six-times-in-less-than-two-years/articleshow/68028982.cms
- Rajesh Y.P. Reuters February 19, 2007: At least 66 killed in India-Pakistan train blast https://www.reuters.com/article/newsOne/idUSDEL34195220070219
- Rawan, Bakht, Inam ur Rahman, Syed (2020) Comparative Frame Analysis of Coverage of Kashmir Conflict in Indian and Pakistani Newspapers from War/Peace Journalism Perspective. Sir Syed Journal of Education & Social Research, Vol. 3, Issue 2, 2020 (April–June) ISSN 2706-6525 (online), ISSN 2706-8285 (Print) ISSN 2706-9362(CD-ROM), ISSN 2706-6525 (ISSN-L) https://doi.org/10.36902/sjesr-vol3-iss2-2020(338-345)

- Rawat, Mukesh (2019), India Today: Pakistan suspends trade ties with India. Who gains, who loses from Imran Khan's move: August 09, 2019 https://www.indiatoday.in/news-analysis/story/pakistan-suspends-trade-with-india-imran-khan-article-370-jammu-kashmir-1578817-2019-08-09
- Reese, S.D. (2010). Finding frames in a web of culture: The case of the War on Terror. In P. D'Angelo & J. A. Kuypers (eds.), Doing news framing analysis: Empirical and theoretical perspectives (pp. 17–42). New York: Routledge.

References:

- Riaz, S., Ahmad, S., & Shah, B. H. (2018). Kashmir Issue And Pak-Indian Press: Content Analysis of Leading Newspapers. ISSRA Papers, X(II), 53-68.
- Richardson, Louise. What Terrorists Want: Understanding the Enemy, Containing the Threat, John Murray, 2006, London
- Rosen, Jay. Framing the News The Triggers, Frames, and Messages in Newspaper Coverage. Project for Excellence in Journalism 1900 M Street NW Suite 210 | Washington DC 2009 202-293-7394 | www.journalism.org A Study of the Project for Excellence in Journalism and Princeton Survey Research Associates. https://www.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/8/legacy/framingthenews.pdf
- Saddiqa, A., & Ullah, F. (2019). A Comparative Study of the Kashmir Conflict Coverage in Pakistani and Indian Press. Global Social Sciences Review (GSSR), 1-9.
- Sama TV, Web desk, 16 February 2019. Pakistan is taking action against Jaish-e-Muhammad, Fawad Chaudhry tells Indian media, https://www.samaa.tv/news/2019/02/pakistan-is-taking-action-against-jaish-e-muhammad-fawad-chaudhry-tells-indian-media/
- Scheufele & Tewksbury (2007), Framing, agenda setting, and priming: The evolution of three media effects models, Journal of Communication, 57(1), p9-20
- Scheufele, DA (1999), Framing as a theory of media effects, Journal of Communication
- Schneider, Sandra L. (1992) University of South Florida, Framing and Conflict: Aspiration Level Contingency, the Status Quo, and Current Theories of Risky Choice, Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory, and Cognition 1992, Vol. 18, No. 5, 1040-1057
- Schudson, M (1978), Discovering the News: A Social History of American Newspapers, New York: Basic Books
- Sharma, Aditya, News 18, February 17, 2019. Pulwama Bomber Was Radicalised After Cops Forced Him to Rub Nose on Ground, Beat Him Up, Say Parents. https://www.news18.com/news/india/pulwama-bomber-was-radicalised-after-cops-forced-him-to-rub-nose-on-ground-beat-him-up-say-parents-2038441.html
- Sharma, Ankur, 16 Februry, 2019, My Nation: Pulwama attack: Traces of ammonium nitrate, RDX found at terror site, https://www.mynation.com/amp/news/pulwama-attack-traces-of-ammonium-nitrate-rdx-found-terror-site-pn0ka3
- Shaw, I. S. (2012). Human rights journalism. Advances in Reporting Humanitarian Interventions, Basingsto e: Palgrave.
- Shinar, D. (2004). Media Peace Discourse: Constraints, Concepts and Building Blocks. Conflict & Communication Online, 3(1/2), 1-8.
- Shoemaker, P. & Reese, S. D. (1996). Mediating the Message. New York: Longman Publishers Shyamlal Yadav "RSS and the idea of Akhand Bharat," The Indian Express, January 4, 2016"

- Siddiqa, Ayesha. The Diplomat, March 13, 2019, Jaish-e-Mohammed: Under the Hood Who are Jaish-e-Mohammed? https://thediplomat.com/2019/03/jaish-e-mohammed-under-the-hood/
- Siddiqui, Naveed (2019). DAWN, February 15, 2019: India withdraws Most Favoured Nation status for Pakistan. https://www.dawn.com/news/1463999
- Siddiqui, Naveed, Dawn 26 February 2019. 'Dialogue not war' is solution to Pak-India relations: Turkish Ambassador, https://www.dawn.com/news/1465978
- Sifton, John., Asia Advisory Director, Human Rights Watch (2014), "The plight of religious minorities in India", Tom Lantos Human Rights Commission Testimony by Human Rights Watch, Hearing of April 04, 2014.
- Sinan Siyech, Mohammed (2019). The Pulwama Attack's After Effects: Fake News and Rumours published on 04 March, 2019. file:///E:/Thesis%20work/Lit%20Review/muhammad%20senan.pdf
- Siraj, S. A. (2008). War or Peace Journalism in Elite US Newspapers: Exploring News Framing in Pakistan-India Conflict. ResearchGate. Retrieved from http://issi.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2014/06/1303370133_44311323.pdf
- Siyech, Mohammed Sinan. (2019). The Pulwama Attack: significance, implication and the way forward. *Counter Terrorist Trends and Analyses* Vol. 11, No. 4 (April 2019), pp. 6-10 (5 pages) Published by: International Centre for Political Violence and Terrorism Research
- Siyech, Mohammed Sinan. The Pulwama Attack's After Effects: Fake News and Rumours. RSIS Commentary, No. 034—4 March 2019
- Slater. Joanna, Masih. Niha, The Washington Post February 15, 2019, Modi vows action after dozens die in deadliest attack in Indian-held Kashmir in 3 decades, https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/asia_pacific/indias-modi-promises-retaliation-after-worst-attack-in-kashmir-in-three-decades-kills-dozens/2019/02/15/f5dd55d6-309e-11e9-8781-763619f12cb4_story.html
- SNIDERMAN M. <u>PAUL.</u> Psychological and cultural foundations of prejudice: The case of anti-Semitism in Quebec
- Soroka, S.N. (2003). Media, Public Opinion, and Foreign Policy. International Journal of Press/Politics, 8(1), 27-48.
- Soroka, S.N. (2003). Media, Public Opinion, and Foreign Policy. International Journal of Press/Politics, 8(1), 27-48.
- Special Correspondent, The Hindu (2020). India Protests Ceasefire Violation by Pakistan Forces, November 14, 2020. https://www.thehindu.com/news/national/india-summons-charge-daffaires-of-pak-mission-over-ceasefire-violations-along-loc/article33100633.ece
- Sredharan, Chindu (2009). REPORTING KASHMIR An analysis of the conflict coverage in Indian and Pakistani newspapers, http://eprints.bournemouth.ac.uk/17116/1/Sreedharan%2CC Ph.D 2009.pdf
- Stromback, J (2005), Framing of the Iraq War in the Elite Newspapers in Sweden and the United States, presented at the International Communication Association Annual Meeting, New York: NY

- Tewksbury, D. & Scheufele, D.A. (2008). News framing theory and research. In J. Bryant & M.B. Oliver (Eds.). Advance in theory and research (3rd ed., 17-33), New York, USA: Routledge.
- The News, February 15, 2019 https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/432039-44-indian-troops-killed-in-ihk-bus-blast
- The Times of India, 15 February 2019, Jaish terrorists attack CRPF convoy in Kashmir, kill at least 38 personnel, https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/37-crpf-jawans-martyred-in-ied-blast-in-jks-pulwama/articleshow/67992189.cms
- The Times of India, 15 February 2019. <u>Pulwama attack 'matter of grave concern': Pakistan https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/pulwama-attack-matter-of-grave-concern-pakistan/articleshow/68002500.cms</u>
- The Wire, 16 January 2020. CDS Bipin Rawat Advocates Putting Young Kashmiri Children in 'De-Radicalisation Camps' https://thewire.in/security-security/cds-bipin-rawat-9-11
- Thomas, R (2000), How India sees through western reports in Degraded Capability: The Media and the Kosovo Crisis (Hammond P & Herman E, eds), London: Pluto, p185-195
- Thussu, D K (2002), Managing the Media in an Era of Round-the-Clock News: notes from India's tele-war, Journalism Studies, 3 (2), Routledge, p203-212
- Timesnownews.com February 15, 2019, Punjab announces Rs 12 lakh compensation for families of martyred CRPF soldiers, https://www.timesnownews.com/india/article/pulwama-attack-punjab-announces-rs-12-lakh-compensation-for-families-of-martyred-crpf-soldiers/366776
- Tuchman, G. (1978). Making news: A study in the construction of reality. New York: Free Press.
- Tversky, A., & Kahneman, D. (1981). The framing of decisions and the rationality of choice. Science, 221, 453-458
- Van Dijk, T.A. (1992). Racism and argumentation: "Race riot" rhetoric in tabloid editorials. In F.H van Eemeren (Ed.), Argumentation illuminated
- Van Dijk, T.A. (2011). Discourse and Ideology. In van Dijk, T.A. (Ed). Discourse Studies: A Multidisciplinary Introduction (pp. 379-407). London: Sage.
- Web Desk, India Today February 14, 2019: Pulwama terror attack: Jaish-e-Mohammed claims responsibility with video of suicide bomber Adil Dar. https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/pulwama-terror-attack-kashmir-jaish-e-mohammad-adil-ahmad-dar-1456169-2019-02-14
- Wolfsfeld, G. (2004). Media and the Path to Peace, Cambridge University Press
- Wolfsfeld, Gadi. Media and the Path to Peace. Cambridge University Press, 2004. https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511489105
- Xinhua (2020), India carries out over 3,000 ceasefire violations this year: Pakistan, XINHUANET, 21-12-2020, http://www.xinhuanet.com/english/2020-12/21/c 139605429.htm
- Zaheer, L. (2016). War or Peace Journalism: Comparative Analysis of Pakistan's English and Urdu Media Coverage of Kashmir Conflict. A Research Journal of South Asian Studies, 31(2), 713-722.

- Zaheer, Lubna. "War or Peace Journalism: Comparative analysis of Pakistan's English and Urdu media coverage of Kashmir conflict." A Research Journal of South Asian Studies 31.2 (2016): 713-722.
- Zaller, J. R. (1992). *The nature and origins of mass opinion*. Cambridge University Press. https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511818691