Running Head: REPORTING OF BALUCHISTAN CONFLICT

How the Victims in Baluchistan Conflict were reported? Comparison of News Reports of Dawn and News International (2016)

Hamid Ullah Khan Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation

JPDC

Volume 03-Issue 02 July-December 2019 Article Doi: https://doi.org/10.36968/JPDC-V03-I02-03

Author Note

Hamid Ullah Khan is senior producer at Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation (PBC). He also completed his MPhil in media and communication studies.

Email: producerhamid@gmail.com

Abstract

The Baluchistan conflict has affected the whole province in all respects. The effects of the massive human loss reached to nearly all the families; the sky also did see the human rights violations and the collateral damages affected the economy as well. The study investigates the Baluchistan conflict through content analysis technique from the perspective of human rights journalism model developed by Shaw and framed the study by applying HRJ and HWJ. The two widely read English dailies Dawn and the News International were analyzed for one year from January 2016 to December 2016. The English Print media in Pakistan usually projects the basic human rights issues and so has projected violation of victims' rights in Baluchistan as well as provided platforms for solution of such issues. The English print media also played its due role from the perspective of human rights journalism and human wrong journalism in Baluchistan conflict. The Dawn covered more victims' stories but framed them in less HRJ perspectives highlighted the victims, provided the solutions while the News International covered less victims' stories but framed them in more HRJ perspectives, reported the victims' issues and provided solutions..

Key Words: print media, conflict, framing theory, human right journalism

How the Victims in Baluchistan Conflict were reported? Comparison of News Reports of Dawn and News International (2016)

Introduction

The province of Baluchistan has seen several conflicts since the creation of Pakistan and hundreds of people became victims. The English print media in Pakistan did give coverage to victims' issues. The study aim is to analysis that how the daily Dawn and the News International reported and framed the Baluchistan conflict through human rights journalism model and to find out the differences in reporting as well as to analysis the reportage pattern of Baluchistan conflict through human rights journalism perspectives.

Baluchistan is the largest province among other provinces of Pakistan and has a history of struggle and conflicts, since creation of Pakistan; Baluchistan has experienced several conflicts by nationalist forces with the state, first conflict was fought in 1948, second in 1962, third in 1974 and last one in 2006. There are several drivers of conflict in Baluchistan like political, economic, natural resources deprivation and fundamentalist ideology. The state dominancy over natural resources and unequal distribution of it has been a consent theme in Baluchistan nationalist of grievance and reason for conflict. It has observed by the mass communication practitioners that human rights are more newsworthy and media takes interest not only in violations of human rights but also promote and protect human rights. In fact, the freedom of the media is itself human rights and by media, citizens can hold governments accountable. Human right journalism is a journalism that challenges social, political, economic and cultural imbalances of the society as according to Shaw" in human rights journalism the journalist understands the human rights violation reasons and writes about its prevention in the ongoing conflict".

In conflict, human rights journalism has two folds one is, media has the ability to expose the abuses of the victims and the reporters are the key actors in showing the actual situation of the victims in the conflict zones, this is called human rights reporting and the second is free speech which is also right of human. The human rights journalism is based on human rights principles and it is a right based journalism. The development of human rights journalism can contribute to the promotion of peace and human rights and the Pakistani print media projected human rights violations and shaped public opinion.

Human Rights Journalism

Media aspires to tell in news stories based on truth, accuracy and fairness as good journalism, creates awareness of what is acceptable and what is unacceptable and can remind to the public of moral responsibilities. In this sense it becomes our duty to protect the violations of human rights during conflict. The diagnostic style of reporting that offers a critical reflection of the experiences and needs of the victims and perpetrators of human rights violation is called human rights journalism (Shaw 107), The human rights journalism tries to understand the basic reasons of violations and to prevent further violations as well as try to produce solution in such a manner that would not create a way for further violations.

Print media in Pakistan produce valuable information about the human rights issues from the conflict zones. The human rights journalism tries to play a role of proactive not dramatic and reactive in conflict situation and it also motivate the readers to come forward and actively participate in the resolution of the conflict among the different conflicting parties. In the context of Pakistani media, the English press has better reportage of human rights issues and educate readers.

In Baluchistan the human rights violation occurs and media shows sensationalized news instead to focus on human rights violations (Jaffer 2012, Zurutuza 2015). Research shows that media in conflict play good role as it has power of transmitting information from the conflict zones to the audiences and it also contribute role in increase of violence or spread peace through peace journalism and contribute role in supporting process in the conflict situations (Oze 2014, Hussain 2016, Aslam 2011, Prakash 2013, Kristin and William 2016) while in conflict situation the victims news become newsworthy and debatable among the reporters (Yousaf 2009) and Maurice (2013) observes that in conflicts media sometimes ignore the coverage of victims and refugees and cover the conflicts in order to benefits the powers.

Review of Literature

Conflict exists in any situation in which parties (states or other actors) disagree over performed outcomes. Conflict becomes more salient when it leads to violence (see global issues, page-297). When conflict erupted it has challenges and threats for state and fundamentalist ideology, socio-economic and political factors are the causes of conflict eruption (Oze 2014, Odine 2013, Osumah 2014). Baluchistan conflict has serious as well as less threats to national security

(Prakash 2013, Hussain 2015 &2016) and Lee (2004) argues that in conflict situation media do not cross the limit for the sake of national interest. The print media play positive role in conflict as it covered miseries of the victims, resolve conflict, promote peace and also promote war journalism ((Mnjama and Acayo, 2004, Becker 2004, Aslam 2016, Siraj 2008, Fredrick 2012, Anderson and Hughes 2014). Media in conflict give coverage to civilians sufferings and shows compassions or ignored victims sufferings (Hoijer, Arne and Ottosen 2002) while Hackett (2006) shows that for promotion of peace journalism media should reinforce public communication rights not as a freedom of expression but as a means of public communication and in conflict objectivity in journalism is must for promotion of peace journalism (Kempf 2007). The media has different approaches towards conflicts in the world; media scholars and researchers worked and concluded results as in conflicts of Baluchistan, media in Pakistan gave attention towards peace journalism (Hussain 2015, Aarushi 2013. Shaw (2012) argues that rethinking of the form based on the insights of peace journalism is human rights journalism. The Pakistani print media in conflict framed the situations in both positive and negative sense, the news stories over the conflict framed in peace, war, and human rights journalism, the true facts faced by the victims are mostly hidden, some promote peace environment while priority has been given to the political figures, parties, state and security and avoided or little heed has been given to the real facts and conditions of the victims and their rights.

Theoretical Framework

The study is theoretical linked with framing theory and human rights journalism model. The study aim is to explore the news stories in each frame of the model over the Baluchistan conflict by two English dailies the News international and The Dawn. Entman farming theory says that to frame a communicating message is to promote certain facts of a perceived reality. Baren and Davis says that in our daily life every person has expectations and make sense and then interpret it and for this sociologist Goffman in 1974 developed frame analysis that provide a systematic way of how to use expectations of routine life situations and people in them, called the framing process.

Research Questions

The following research questions were developed to investigate the aim of the study.

- 1. How the Baluchistan Conflict is reported through HRJ perspectives?
- 2. Do the News International and Dawn differ from each other while reporting on Baluchistan Conflict?
- 3. How much news stories are reported in each of frames in the human rights journalism model?

Research Methodology

For this study content analysis technique was applied as it is useful research technique for analyzing text and offers objective guidelines in the coding of text as well as draw inferences from the data (Prasad), it identifies important themes within body of content and involves keywords or content followed by the interpretation of the context in shape of counting and comparison (Hsieh & Shannon 2005).

Time Period of Study: For the period of one year from January 2016 to December 2016, news reports related to the victims of Baluchistan conflict published in both the Pakistan's elite English newspapers the Dawn and the News International were analyzed through systematic sampling and applied framing theory and human rights journalism model as in conflict situation the coverage of English dailies influences the policy makers in the country, frame political issues and gives coverage to the violence and human rights violation (Rahman &Ejaz, Zia & Syedah 2015, Zaheer 2016)

Sample Frame: The news reports on Baluchistan conflict victims published in Dawn and the News International during January 2016 to December 2016 is selected as sample frame as Neuman (2015) writes that after conceptualization of the universe there is need to create operational definition for the universe idea in such a manner that cover all the elements of the universe which is the sampling frame

Sample Size: For this study the sample size has selected, from January 2016 to December 2016, total 728 issues (except newspapers holidays) in one year of both newspapers issues are published. In these issues of both the newspapers, two last week's publications in a month of both the selected newspapers, total 364 (except newspapers holidays) publications, containing stories under discussion of victims of Baluchistan conflict are drawn as sample size for analysis

Variables

On the basis of these defined variables the study was analyzed

1. Humanitarianism

Non Violence Oriented: In the context of text in the printed stories, the usage of peaceful words, absence or lack of violence. The news story which promotes peace and indicates peaceful environment and avoid violence in the conflict situation.

Structural Violence Oriented: Some social institutions or social structure harm the people and victims of the conflict and prevent the victims from meeting their needs and shows the injustice and exploitation built in the social system of the affectees in conflict that produces poverty for many victims and valuable for few. Shortly deny from the rights of the people provided to them in the society.

Cultural Violence Oriented: News reports that indicates that some people in the conflict areas are superiors and others are inferiors. In this the class, race, sex, and religion are indicated. They are not respected and treat discrimination.

2. Truth

Human Wrongs Oriented/Truth: When the true rights of the humanity presented wrongly to the public through media, the news reports that promote and present rights of the conflict victims wrongly.

3. Empowerment

People/Human Face Oriented: Recognition of the dignity of the conflict victims and their families. To give confidence to the victims of conflict that the conflict affectees stronger and to know their rights of self determination

4. Holism

Holistic problems Solving: To identify the problems of the victims of the conflict and to provide solutions to the problems, to identify the hidden problems of the affectees and provide a platform through which solution possible to their problems.

In the Human rights journalism model, HWJ is opposite to HRJ as in this selective justice instead of collective, its bias against the vulnerable voices of the conflict victims, reportage in media is reactively and media does not presents human rights violations of the victims of conflict. The operational definitions of HRJ variables are as

5. Competition:

Violence: Presentation of power, intensity and destruction, threat against group or community during the conflict situation in reporting.

Drama: Hide the actual situation and presentation of fake information about the conflict victims in reporting. Avoid factual situations of the conflict and perform a dramatic role in reporting.

Proactive: Presentation of huge loss of humanity, displacement and damages of property in reporting during the conflict situation.

- **6. Propaganda Oriented:** Presentation of reporting which promote that one conflicting party violates the human rights and the other not or unbiased reporting that provoke conspiracy in the conflict situation about the violations of victim's rights.
- **7. Demonization Oriented:** Presentation of the conflict victims in reporting in such a way that they have no rights and they are in support to the conflicting parties, criticize them instead of reporting the violations of their rights. To show the people/victims as they are demonizing by the community and reporting mainly focuses on violations of human rights by them.
- **8. Partially Solution Oriented:** To present the people/affectees/victims of conflict in such a way that they are only in needs of temporary facilities and ignore their basic needs and requirements as they had enjoyed before conflict situation. Or during conflict situation provide immediate physical needs and ignore the solutions that suit for long term structural solutions.

Data Analysis

The final collected data consist of 238 news reports of victims of the Baluchistan conflict in both the newspapers for one year in perspectives of human rights and human wrong journalism. The dawn newspaper gave more coverage to the victims in one year; published 137 (57.56%) news reports and the quantity of news stories in human wrong journalism perspectives were greater than the news published over the victims contained the texts and messages of human rights journalism perspectives. The News International in one year published 101 (42.44%) news reports over the victims of Baluchistan conflict and the news reports quantity of the human rights journalism perspectives were greater than the news published contained the texts of human wrong journalism perspectives

HRJ and HWJ Frames

The number of news stories in human wrong journalism frame in both the newspapers the Dawn and the News international is greater (145 or 60.92 percent) than the news reports in

REPORTING OF BALUCHISTAN CONFLICT

human rights journalism frame (93 or 39.08 percent) over the coverage of the victims of Baluchistan conflict.

The News International gave more coverage (40 or 39.60) to the victims as compared to the Dawn newspaper (53 or 38.40%) in human rights journalism frame

The two newspapers news reports were framed as the Dawn covered the victims of the conflict in shape of 53 (38.40%) news reports of HRJ, 84(61.31%) HWJ and the News International published 40 (39.65%) news reports in HRJ perspectives and 61(60.40%) news reports in HWJ perspectives, Research Question 1. How the Baluchistan Conflict is reported through HRJ perspectives?

Table No.1

HRJ and HWJ twelve months news reports percentages and frequencies in Dawn and News

International

Newspapers	HRJ	HWJ	Total
The Dawn	53 (38.40%)	84 (61.31%)	137(57.56%)
The News International	40(39.60%)	61(60.40%)	101(42.44%)
Total	93 (39.08%)	145 (60.92%)	238

As per specified sampling each month's last two weeks newspapers, the two newspapers were analyzed and data on the selected study were identified, for the period of one year from January 2016 to December 2016, 238 news reports of the conflict of Baluchistan from both newspapers were identified. The Dawn newspaper on front, back and national pages published 137 (57.56%) news reports while the News International gave coverage to the victims in 101 (42.44%) news stories on front, back and national pages.

The Dawn newspapers on selected pages over the selected topic published 53 (38.40%) news stories of human rights journalism perspectives, 84 (61.31%) news reports of human wrong journalism perspectives as identified while the News International gave coverage to the victims in shape of 40 (39.60%) news reports in human rights journalism perspectives and 61 (60.40%) news reports of human wrong journalism perspective. The table no.1 indicates that the News

International published 40 (39.60%) of news reports of human rights journalism perspectives as compared to the Dawn 53 (38.40%) news reports

Research Question. 2 Do the News International and Dawn differ from each other while reporting on Baluchistan Conflict?

Table. No. 2. Identification of News Stories and percentages from January 2016 to December 2016 on Coverage of Victims of Baluchistan Conflict in Front, Back and National pages in the News International and Dawn

Newspapers		Total		
	Front	Back	National	
The Dawn	21(15.33%)	09(6.57%)	107(78.10%)	137(57.56%)
The News international	23(22.77%)	32(31.68%)	46(45.55%)	101(42.44%)

The coverage of Dawn newspaper to the Baluchistan conflict victims on front pages identified 21 (15.33%) news stories, on back pages 09 (6.5%) and in the national pages 107 (78.10%) news stories while news published 23 (22.77% news stories on front pages, 32 (31.68%) on back pages and 46(45.55%) new stories on national pages in one year from January 2016 to December 2016.

Difference is found during coverage of victims of Baluchistan conflict, Dawn newspaper as whole gave more coverage (137 or 57.56%) while the News international reported the victims of Baluchistan in (101 or 42.44 %) news reports. The coverage of the Dawn newspaper was found high as compared to the News international. (see table 2)

Research Question 3. How much news stories are reported in each of frames in the human rights journalism model?

Table No. 3

Distributions of News Stories

Human Rights Journalism	%	Human Wrong Journalism	%
Tuman Kights Journansin	70	Tuman Wrong Sournansm	/0

Humanitarianism	36	38.70	Competition Oriented	125	86.20
Truth	06	6.45	Propaganda Oriented	10	6.90
Empowerment	33	35.48	Demonization Oriented	01	0.69
Holism	18	19.35	Partially Solution Oriented	09	6.21
Total	93	39.08	Total	145	60.92

The one year collection and identification of news reports in daily dawn and the News International over the issues of human rights in the conflict of Baluchistan shows that both the newspapers on selected pages gave coverage and presented the news reports contained the text of human rights issues as per model of human rights journalism and human wrong journalism., 93 news reports were identified in the HRJ and 145 news reports in the HWJ. In the Humanitarianism category 36(38.70%) news reports were identified, in the truth category 06 (6.45%), empowerment 33 (35.48%) and in the holism category 18 news reports of 19.35 % were identified while in the human wrong journalism perspectives 125 (86.20%) news reports were identified in the competition category, 10 (6.90%) news reports in propaganda oriented, 01 (0.69%) demonization oriented and 9(6.21%) news stories were identified in the partially oriented solution category. (See table 3)

Conclusion

The study has tried to look into what the Pakistan's elite English print media played its due role in reporting of Baluchistan conflict in human rights journalism perspectives as well as projected the hidden human rights issues and provided platforms for solutions to the victims

Baluchistan conflict. The findings reveal that elite English print media in Pakistan in Baluchistan conflict play its role in the perspectives of human rights journalism and human wrong journalism.

1. How the Baluchistan Conflict is reported through HRJ perspectives?

It has been concluded that News International frame the victims more in human rights journalism perspectives than the Dawn such as Alfini (2015) shows that human rights issues frame was dominant in New York and Washington Post, Nwankwo (2011) through agenda setting theory shows that media create awareness on human rights and its abuses and Venkateshwarlu (2012) shows that media gave as much coverage to human rights stories as they are covering most other kinds of stories while Pinto (2007) shows that in India print media play significant role in promoting the cause of human rights.

2. Do the News International and Dawn differ from each other while reporting on Baluchistan Conflict?

The study also concludes the difference between the two newspapers on reporting the victims of Baluchistan Conflict as the Dawn newspaper gave more coverage to Baluchistan conflict as compared to the News International as Hussain (2015), Safdar, Budiman, Hamid and Biniti (2014), Young (2012) and Yousaf (2015) identify the framing as well as coverage difference among newspapers on such issue.

3. How much news stories are reported in each of frames in the human rights journalism model?

The study concludes that Dawn newspaper framed mostly the victims of the conflict on national pages in news stories in human wrong journalism perspectives, framed violence and proactive and it has also did coverage to the human rights journalism perspectives projected the victim's issues and platform for solutions such as Siraj and Hussain(2016) shows that media give more heed to war and less coverage to peace building while in peace frame highlighted the issues and suggested means for solution of the conflict. Zia & Syedah (2015) concluded that print media negatively framed the conflict in Kashmir and did not play role in peaceful resolution.

The News International framed the victims news stories in the human rights journalism perspectives highlighted the issues and provided solutions and it has also framed the victims in human wrong journalism perspectives highlighted violence and proactive as Kaplan(2002) shows that media is the key means of information on human rights violations while Radoli (2011) shows that media played role in enhancing violence as well inspiring efforts to build peace and the

violence lead to violations of human rights and media is also a voice of society that can serve to protect and promote human rights and transform conflicts.

The Dawn newspaper framed the victims of the Baluchistan conflict in its all news stories in selected pages and in specified time period more HWJ and less in HRJ perspectives while the News International framed the victims in its all news stories in selected pages and in specified time period more HRJ perspectives and less HWJ perspectives.

Recommendation

At the end the following recommendations are suggested for the reporters engaged in human rights reporting, institutions working for human rights in conflict zones.

- 1. Print media should give special heed to the promotion of human rights during conflict.
- 2. The coverage of human rights violation in the conflict zones is a dangerous, the media organization should provide safe platforms along with special remuneration to reporters.
- 3. It is the utmost duty of the reporters to find out the facts based news report during conflict and training opportunities should provide to reporters that can address human rights issues of conflict victims.
- 4. Majority of human rights issues news stories were found in national pages, media organizations should give space for the reportage of human rights issues and violations on main pages
- 5. During conflict, institutions working for the well-being of victims should provide all the basic needs and requirements not on temporary base only but for long term that can enable the victims to resolve all their issues on permanent base.

References

- Hussain, S. (2014). Reporting on terror: Why are the voices of peace unheard?. *Conflict & Communication*, 13(2).
- Odine, M. (2013). Media coverage of conflict in Africa. *Global Media Journal-African Edition*, 7(2), 201-225.
- Kempf, W., & Reimann, M. (2002). The presentation of alternative ways of settling the Gulf conflict in German, Norwegian and Finnish media..
- Höijer, B., Nohrstedt, S. A., & Ottosen, R. (2002). The Kosovo War in the Media-Analysis of a Global Discursive Order. *Conflict & Communication*, 1(2).
- Prakash, A. (2013). Peace or war journalism: case study of the Baluchistan conflict in Pakistan. *Strategic Analysis*, *37*(5), 621-636.
- Hussain, S. (2015). Baluchistan: Reaping the benefits of peace journalism. *Conflict & Communication*, 14(2).
- Hussain, S. (2016). Media coverage of Taliban: Is peace journalism the solution?. *Asia Pacific media educator*, 26(1), 31-46.
- Aslam, Rukhsana. "From challenge to hope." Media Development 58, no. 2 (2011).
- Youssef, M. (2009). Their Word against Ours: News Discourse of the 2003 Gulf War Civilian Casualties in CNN and Aljazeera. *Global Media Journal: Mediterranean Edition*, 4(2).
- Hackett, R. A. (2006). Is peace journalism possible? Three frameworks for assessing structure and agency in news media. *Conflict and Communication Online*, 5(2), 1-13.
- Acayo, C., & Mnjama, N. (2004). The print media and conflict resolution in Northern Uganda. *African Journal on Conflict Resolution*, 4(1), 27-43.

REPORTING OF BALUCHISTAN CONFLICT

- Kempf, W. (2007). Peace journalism: A tightrope walk between advocacy journalism and constructive conflict coverage. *Conflict & communication online*, 6(2).
- Davis, D., & Baran, S. J. (2011). *Mass Communication Theory: Foundations, Ferment, and Future*. CENGAGE Learning.
- Shaw, I. S. (2012). Human Rights Journalism. United Kingdom: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Zia, A., & Syedah, H. (2015). Use of print media for conflict resolution and peace building: A case study of Kashmir dispute. *NDU Journal*, 161-180.
- Rahman, B. H., & Eijaz, A. (2014). Pakistani media as an agent of conflict or conflict resolution:

 A case of Lal Masjid in Urdu and English Dailies. *Pakistan Vision*, 15(2), 238.
- Lee, S. T., & Maslog, C. C. (2005). War or peace journalism? Asian newspaper coverage of conflicts. *Journal of communication*, 55(2), 311-329.
- Lee, C. H. (2004). News coverage of the US war with Iraq: a comparison of the New York times, the Arab news, and the Middle East times (Doctoral dissertation).