

## Journal of Peace, Development and Communication



**Volume 05, Issue 1, January-March 2021**  
 pISSN: 2663-7898, eISSN: 2663-7901  
**Article DOI: <https://doi.org/10.36968/JPDC-V05-I01-21>**  
**Homepage: <https://pdfpk.net/pdf/>**  
**Email: [se.jpdc@pdfpk.net](mailto:se.jpdc@pdfpk.net)**

<b>Article:</b>	<b>Critical Discourse Analysis of the Editorial Coverage of Osama Bin Laden Operation by the Pakistani Media</b>
<b>Author(s):</b>	Amna Zulfiqar Assistant Professor, Department of Mass Communication, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad
	Sadaf Asif Lecturer, Department of Mass Communication, National University of Modern Languages Islamabad
	Ayesha Siddiqua Lecturer, Department of Mass Communication, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad
<b>Published:</b>	30 <sup>th</sup> March 2021
<b>Publisher Information:</b>	Journal of Peace, Development and Communication (JPDC)
<b>To Cite this Article:</b>	Zulfiqar, Amna, et al. (2021). "Critical Discourse Analysis of the Editorial Coverage of Osama Bin Laden Operation by the Pakistani Media" <i>Journal of Peace, Development and Communication</i> , vol. Volume 5, no. Issue 1, 2021, pp. 240-254, <a href="https://doi.org/10.36968/JPDC-V05-I01-21">https://doi.org/10.36968/JPDC-V05-I01-21</a>
<b>Author(s) Note:</b>	Amna Zulfiqar is serving as Assistant Professor at Department of Mass Communication, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad Email: <a href="mailto:amzulfiqar@numl.edu.pk">amzulfiqar@numl.edu.pk</a>
	Sadaf Asif is serving as Lecturer at Department of Mass Communication, National University of Modern Languages Islamabad. Email: <a href="mailto:saasif@numl.edu.pk">saasif@numl.edu.pk</a>
	Ayesha Siddiqua is serving as Lecturer at Department of Mass Communication, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad. Email: <a href="mailto:asiddiqua@numl.edu.pk">asiddiqua@numl.edu.pk</a>

### **Abstract**

The article is intended to compare and analyze the media discourse in the editorials of two daily English newspapers of Pakistan in the context of one of the most controversial anti-terrorist operation which is named as the Osama Bin Laden (OBL) operation. For this purpose editorials of two leading English newspapers of Pakistan i.e., Dawn and The News were selected from 3<sup>rd</sup> May, 2011, to 26<sup>th</sup> August, 2011. Moreover, the current study employed the method of critical discourse analysis and has also studied the theoretical notion of agenda setting and framing. Results reveal that The News used very strong, rather harsh vocabulary during the editorial coverage of OBL operation. Whereas, Dawn adopted literary phrases and less harsh tone to cover OBL operation. Also, editorials of both the newspapers constructed similar frames such as “failure of military establishment” and “security lapse” throughout the coverage of OBL operation.

**Keywords:** OBL (Osama bin Laden) operation, critical discourse analysis, agenda setting, framing, military establishment

## Introduction

According to Biber (1991) editorials of newspapers are most dominating media discourse and these discourses have their individual features related to language. In the contemporary world newspaper discourses have been frequently researched in order to examine those methods in which language is used to persuade and manipulate the readers. Since, editorials represent the perspective on specific issue, therefore editorial writers utilize different methods to make language persuasive and effective. For language effectiveness there are different techniques and among all the most effective is the use of rhetoric, as the primary objective of using rhetoric is to make media discourse persuasive (Burk, 1969).

Richardson (2007) states that there exist a dialectical relationship between social practices and media discourses because discourses are discursively constructed (p. 26). Similarly Van Dijk (2000) suggested that the main source of media discourse relates to people attitudes, knowledge, and ideologies including politicians, professionals, researchers and other elites (p. 36). This purposed that media holds enormous power on public to influence public opinion. It can be crucial for individuals and society when media constructs the image of any public figure including social activist, politicians or any religious leaders. For instance Osama bin Laden was portrayed “as an evil genius archetype with near mythic abilities” almost in all the major international newspapers (Winch, 2005, pp. 285-299).

Editorial framing is significantly affected by the policies and ideologies of media outlets. Van Dijk TA (1994) suggested that ideologies depict the fundamental requirements that primarily includes the priorities of community as well as social identification (p. 25). Therefore, editorial writers select, assess and explain information to endorse causal explanation or specific interpretation, straightforward appraisal or connection with the news story that consist of organizational policies Van Dijk TA (2001). Saleem N (2007) asserts that media structure is an important instrument which identify the basic problem in the newspaper editorials with the help of headlines, stance and language.

Further, it is elaborated that objective reality is much different from media reality because media has the potential to frame the story by creating a pseudo-event which can be entirely different from the reality of the outer world (Shoemaker & Reese, 1996). Consequently the agenda setting role of media make some issues approachable to public either by its placement or by repetition. As a result, people not only remember these events, but they get influenced and evaluate those events by public assessment standards related to any political candidate (Price & Tewksbury, 1997).

Since, 2011 Pakistan has been brutally hit by several terrorist attacks by terrorist/militants including anti-static feature of suicide attacks, rocket assaults, and bomb explosions hitting the lives of 15,000 military soldiers and 49,000 civilians (Raja, 2013). According to Williams BG (2010), Pakistan has recognized several radical militant groups on the basis of religion, it became difficult for Pakistan to make difference between good and bad terrorist. In order to collaborate with United States in the War on terror, Pakistan army has launched several counter terrorism operations. Among all OBL (Osama bin Laden) operation remained the most significant. Osama bin Laden was the first Islamist founder of Al- Qaeda who was killed on May2, 2011 in Abbottabad by US Navy Seals and operation was code named as Operation Neptune Spear. A CIA led operation along with [Joint Special Operations Command](#), popularly known as JSOC ended a ten year Bin Laden search for his role in September 11 attacks. According to US, the raid on Bin Laden in Pakistan specifically Abbottabad was launched from Afghanistan. US military officials said that after the raid they took Bin Laden’s body to Afghanistan for further identification and his body was buried in the sea within 24 hours of his death in accordance with Islamic tradition. For record Bin Laden followed by Al Qaeda group initiated 1996 Yemen war and attacked several US military soldiers. This operation had consequences on Pak-US relations because US raised

questions on Pakistan intelligence for hiding Bin Laden and secondly Pakistan military forces have become doubtful as they took pride in claiming themselves as professionals and the protector of Pakistan's sovereignty ("[CIA spied on bin Laden from safe house](#)", May 5, 2011, [The Washington Post](#)).

Exploration of newspaper editorials have a lot of importance because newspaper editorials portray the accurate expression of newspaper managers, editors and owners which depict the theoretical foundation for newspapers. Moreover, editorials represent the point of view of media analyst as compare to the people of society (Henry & Tator, 2002: p.93). Therefore, the present study has problem statement which deals with investigating the role of newspapers particularly in utilizing language during the coverage of most significant event i.e., Osama Bin Laden (OBL) operation on 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2011. Critical discourse analysis is used to analyze the editorials of two leading newspapers i.e., Dawn and The News. CDA further investigated styles, themes, slant and discourses constructed in the editorials of two English newspapers of Pakistan. This thorough investigation of editorial discourse and utilization of language would be extremely valuable in extending the literature on role of print media in the context of OBL operation.

### Literature Review

In modern times media is undeniably considered a tool of war. Currently, winning modern wars is dependent on constructing opinion of public because it will help in defeating enemy on theater of war. In case of journalist it's true because the ultimate objective of majority journalist is to fix balanced and unbiased evaluation of conflict. Hence, it remains true that media plays the most important role in constructing public opinion about wars for instance Afghanistan war, Iraq and Vietnam war. During the time of war the role of media is imperative because media has to act as a watchdog, credibility of facts, surveillance and accuracy of facts they collect and disseminate it to public. The other side of media vs. journalist is to rely on the facts they receive from official sources, perhaps they never have freedom from the ongoing notion of national interest (Dimitrova & Stromback, 2008). Fairclough (1992) defines journalism as a document which is constructed by power and ideology that impacts people's knowledge and their social life. It is unavoidable that media content is influenced by ideology and opinion of stakeholders, writers, analyst, editors, publishers and reviewers specifically related to media outlets. Therefore, dissemination of information in the form of media text constructs, alter and influence readers' opinion of their environment that directly effects the objective reality. Fairclough (2001a, p. 231) further explain the concept of CDA as the study of dialectal relationship between discourses. Hence, CDA not only explore how and why but it also deals with whom and what in the media content by concentrating on underlying ingredients for instance ideologies, setting agenda and opinions wrapped with in the media text.

To elaborate the basic role of CDA (Richardson, [2006](#), p. 26) argued that CDA constructs a connection between society and language, and the creation of social happenings and collective perspectives. Few researchers suggested that electronic, print and online media plays a vital role in interacting with public specifically with reference to what is happening in the world. However, there are cases where audience does not have access to direct knowledge or they are unable to experience the latest happenings of the world, they are primarily dependent on media to update those readers (Happer & Philo, [2013](#)). Researchers like Baker (2012), Richardson ([2006](#)), Van Dijk([1998](#)) have identified that CDA assisted researchers to examine the hidden ideological motive existing in the discourse that is created by media.

Bilal, et al. (2012) examined ideological representation and construction through the use of language in the editorials of two English newspapers of Pakistan i.e., Dawn and The Nation. Van Dijk's (1995) ideological analysis is used in order to explain the connection between language and ideology and to further examine the ideological construction.

According to results, the lexical structure and sentence construction of media discourse plays a fundamental role in dissemination and propagation of hidden and prominent ideologies. Moreover, editorials of both the newspapers tacitly or explicitly determines the ideological differences (Bilal, Rfaqat, Hasan, Mansoor, & Zahra, 2012).

### **Theoretical Framework**

According to (Coleman, McComb, Shaw & Weaver, 2009) newspapers discourse play a vital role in setting the agenda and to influence pictorial representation in the mind of readers. Moreover, news media impacts the understanding of news and subject and also the communication process. McCombs and Shaw (1972) explained the agenda setting function of mass media and suggested that media sets public agenda in such a way that it does not only tell you what to think but they also tell what to think about. Over the period of time, news media has considerable influence on narrative of public agenda and also setting news agenda has popularly become part of discussions related to public agenda and journalism.

Agenda setting theory is closely related to the concept of framing. The most used definition of framing is defined as framing particularly includes two main aspects one is known as selection whereas the other is known as salience. Framing means to select few aspects of supposed reality and make them salient in an interactive text in such a way that support specific problem, moral assessment, unintentional interpretation, and behavioral recommendation for issue described (Entman, 1993, p. 52)

Relationship between public and media is extremely important because people are dependent on media for news. Therefore, media sets news agenda which is further transformed as public agenda by framing events in particular ways. Hameed (2015) examined the portrayal of Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) in two prominent newspapers of Pakistan (Jang and Dawn). Researcher after conducting content analysis of newspapers showed that TTP was negatively framed as militants/terrorist group rather than friends. Moreover, both the newspapers gave negative coverage in terms of language and tone. News media projected negative image of TTP by linking TTP with Pakistan. News frames depict that Pakistan is responsible for widespread of terrorism in Pakistan.

Yousaf (2015) conducted research on Chinese media and results revealed that Chinese media framed Pakistan as victim and sufferer of terrorist based activities. Also, Chinese media recognized Pakistan's policies for encountering terrorism. Due to media framing, public frames the issues the same way media guides them. Muin (2011) in another study noted that media gave massive coverage to three most prominent issues i.e., Iraq war, 9/11 attacks, weapons of mass destruction and news frames showed favorable coverage to US administration. Therefore, public opinion remained the same the way media framed three issues.

Ayoubi & Ahmed (2013) analyzed the news coverage of drone attacks in two newspapers of Pakistan i.e., Dawn and The Nation. Results reveal that both newspapers gave unfavorable coverage on Drone attacks by US on Waziristan. Because of this unfavorable coverage of news frames public constructed feelings of bitterness, anger, and aggression towards American administration. In the same way, Dar & Ali (2015) examined framing analysis and investigated articles of two leading newspapers i.e., New York Times and The News on the subject of drone attacks. Results reveal that New York Times gave positive coverage on drone attacks and supported US administration whereas The News gave negative coverage and portrayed Drone attacks in negative tone.

Generally, framing analysis has influence that is connected with context of conversation on public Chong D, Druckman JN (2007). Goffman E (1974) describe the structures of media context for journalism and news that help people understand about happening (p. 22). Dorman & Farhang (1987) discussed the frames which are connected with information journalist obtain regarding any event. Frames actually depict the ways journalist

publishes news and public interpret the news as fictional document (p.8). Similarly, US media most of the times portrayed war related themes for example “America Strikes Back” and “America’s New War” (Kellner, 2007).

International news coverage is regulated among countries because of geographical and cultural differences (Galtung & Vincent, 1992). Unfavorable coverage by western media in terms of terrorist and militants to the people of specific country invokes such type of stereotypes in the minds of public who watch and hear (Baran, 2008). US media most of times covered Pakistan negatively and the frames mostly covered West vs., Islam. Moreover, evidence shows that US news media covered Pakistan as fundamentalist Islamic state (Saleem, 2007), a hub of religious terrorism, and politically unbalanced terrorist country (Ali, Jan, & Saleem, 2013). Another study shows that US media portrayed Pakistan negatively particularly in the context of Pakistan-India conflict and framed Pakistan as enemy than as a friend (Siraj, 2008). Therefore, the current study selected OBL operation for examining the editorial treatment of two prominent newspapers of Pakistan i.e, Dawn and The News. Newspapers are selected on the basis of readership and circulation. The reason for selecting OBL is operation is that Osama bin laden was killed on Pakistan’s soil and it was US led military based operation which shows that US showed deep concerns on Pakistan military establishment concerning whether or not they were already aware of his presence and other terrorist like Mullah Omar (Cordesman, 2011). OBL operation got massive coverage by media which shows that media is the powerful force behind creating different frames with the help of language and context. Accordingly, the present study employed the method of critical discourse analysis in order to analyze the editorials by examining slant, style, themes and discourses.

### Research Questions

RQ1 How the editorials of Dawn and The News covered OBL operation?

RQ2 How both the newspapers covered slant in the context of OBL operation?

RQ3 How Dawn and The News covered themes in the context of OBL operation?

RQ4 How discourses are constructed by *Dawn* and *The News* in the context of OBL operation?

### Methodology

Since the objective of paper is to examine the editorial treatment on OBL operation by print media of Pakistan, therefore, the current study employed the method of critical discourse analysis. A critical approach to discourse analysis primarily focuses on media text like job interviews, news reporting, counselling and interviews that explains the manipulative strategies and unfair encounter which are believed to be natural or unbiased to majority of people (Teo, 2000, p.12). The media text under study are the editorials from newspapers because they develop and interpret events in order to influence public opinion, also they massively participate in constructing media discourse with the help of language. The current study collected the data from two newspapers i.e, Dawn and The News. Both the newspapers published 35 editorials out of which 15 editorials were published by Dawn and 20 editorials were published by The News.

The current study selected two newspapers from print media of Pakistan i.e., Dawn and The News. The reason for selecting Dawn newspapers is that it is the oldest newspaper of Pakistan and it has largest readership. Founder of Dawn newspapers was Mr. Jinnah and it was started in 1941. Dawn newspaper is owned by Dawn group of publishers and it has circulation of 109,000 newspapers per day. Dawn newspapers is considered as liberal, moderate and progressive. Whereas The News is another big English newspaper which is also published from London so it is popularly known as The News international. The News hold a liberal political perspective and it has circulation of 140,000 newspapers per day (Ahmed, 2018). The time period selected for the current paper is from 3<sup>rd</sup> May, 2011 to 26<sup>th</sup> August,

2011. The reason for selecting this time period is that OBL operation took place on 2<sup>nd</sup> May, 2011 and majority of the editorials were published in the context of OBL operation.

According to Fairclough (1995a) the purpose behind using critical discourse analysis is to highlight the relation between social process as well as different characteristics of text. Media text consist of media discourses which are believed to be descriptions or apprehensions by social actors (Fairclough, 1995b). For examining the editorials Fairclough model is used which is based on three different levels of analysis: textual analysis, social practices and discursive analysis. As the current research has selected the editorials from newspapers, therefore, textual analysis is used. Fairclough (1995) identified two main aspects of media text to be considered for current analysis: first deals with the structure of proposition whereas second deals with the combination and sequence of the propositions.

## **Results and Discussion**

### ***RQ1. How the editorials of Dawn and The News covered OBL operation?***

Both newspapers gave desirable coverage to OBL operation and published 19 editorials out of which 10 editorials were published by Dawn. During the coverage editor of Dawn has used different styles and prepositions to explain the facts related to OBL operation. Dawn editor used interrogative style of writing and narrated the event by asking various questions like when the independent inquiry took place and when any of the military or civilian leadership was dismissed because of security lapse, therefore, the hidden facts related to this happening will remain ambiguous (Osama Investigation, May 10, 2011, Dawn).

In another editorial Dawn editor raised few other questions on Pakistan military establishment for instance did ***“Pakistan military participated in this US led operation? Did Pakistan army was fully aware of this operation? Did American administration take Pakistan army in confidence related to this operation?”*** Dawn editor being more critical towards these questions answered that if Pakistan military was not aware of this operation then its failure of Pakistan radar and defense system. Editor by using preposition connected two aspects and mention that these questions will remain unanswered, moreover, these unanswered questions may create feeling of terror and fear among the people of Pakistan (Osama Bin Laden, May03, 2011, Dawn).

Dawn editor in one of the editorials mentioned the conspiracy which is connected with release of the photograph of Osama bin Laden. Editor of Dawn explain that if Bin Laden is dead on our soil then why Americans are hesitant towards releasing his photograph as people of Pakistan including media has equal right to know about truthful information as people don't believe on America (New Conspiracy, May06, 2011, Dawn). Dawn mentioned the ineffective defense system of Pakistan and critically quoted that Pakistan military never took responsibility of their inaccuracies specifically when they are unable to perform in the sensitive events. PAF took a daring step and answered the question that why the radar system was inactive during the operation, and answer explain that Afghanistan is no more threat, therefore, the radar system was not workable. Though, PAF was fully aware of helicopter movement which has raised concerns on PAF. Whereas, civilian government was appreciated as they have initiated commission against this operation specifically for the presence of Bin Laden on our soil (Commission troubles, June 03, 2011, Dawn).

The News also gave coverage to OBL operation and published 20 editorials and intensively craped Pakistan military by explaining that civilian government and Pakistan military failed to identify the most wanted person on Pakistan's soil who was few miles away from military academy. According to one of the western analyst Pakistan military is not putting enough efforts to fight against terrorism (After Osama, May 5, 2011, The News).

The News editor focused on media portrayal of OBL operation and highlighted PM Gilani statement that ***“media has portrayed the truth”***. Similarly, Editor used interrogative style of writing and raised questions like why Bin Laden was in Abbottabad and why Pakistan

military had no idea about US operation. In this regard, General Kiyani during his visit at Kharian and Sialkot garrison said to soldiers that media has not played effective role during the coverage of OBL operation (Nothingness, May 11, 2011, The News).

Editor of The News quoted DG ISI statement that **“Pakistan military has no soft corner for terrorists and religious philosophy associated with terrorism”**. Moreover, DG ISI also said that various commissions in the past concluded with facts but the results were never shared with public (House Cleaning, June23, 2011, The News). Editor mentioned very critically that PM showed apprehensions in setting up commission for the current operation because civilian government initiated commission after two weeks of this operation, also it is contemplated that commission will not do anything except making the operation more complicated and there is less chance for independent investigation (Willful Failure, June 6, 2011, The News).

Editor of The News again discussed about the operation and discuss that there are many commissions setup in order to check the failure of Pakistan military, facts were prepared, but they were never disseminated to public (Abbottabad Probe, July 7, 2011, The News). Editor also mentioned that whether Americans will take **a year? Six months? Three months? Or never?**, share the information with media and public, as two weeks passed (Air base Confusion, July 7, 2011, The News). The editorial content of The News showed that Pakistan should get ready for foreign challenges, and also it is intolerable for people of Pakistan to bear these operations, as it generates insecurity among people. At the same editor being suggestive mention that Pakistan military should stay focused, so that they protect their homeland an also the well-being of the people by controlling similar attacks in future (The News, Indian Equation, May 07, 2011).

The News editor discussed in one of the editorial about Deputy Chief of Air Staff Air Marshal Muhammad Hassan and DG ISI showed their firmness for US attack on Pakistan soil including other terrorist operations and to stop drone attacks or otherwise Pakistan will stop NATO supply to Afghanistan (Daring Decisions, May 15, 2011, The News). Editor also quoted that Foreign Minister Shah Mehmood Qureshi supported Pakistan military and said that Pakistan military has power to safeguard the dominance and sovereignty of Pakistan. He said that cabinet meetings are inappropriate in the current situation as US may have plans for other operation within our borders (Probing Questions, May13, 2011, The News).

### **RQ2 How both the newspapers covered slant in the context of OBL operation?**

Dawn during the coverage of OBL operation published ten editorials out of a total 15 editorials zero (0) none positive, thirteen (13) were negative and two (02) as neutral with reference to OBL operation. Total number of the editorials published by The News during the coverage of OBL operation were twenty (20) out of which zero (0) positive, sixteen (16) were negative and zero (0) neutral.

**Table1: Slant of editorials about the OBL operation**

	Negative	Neutral	Positive	Total
Dawn	13	02	0	15
The News	16	04	0	20

Dawn editor used slant negatively operation discussed that from the time of 9/11 attack Pakistan is the only country suffering from terrorism. As a result of terrorism 30, 0000 soldiers and civilians have been killed (Chinese support, May 20, 2011, Dawn). Moreover, PM Gilani refused to take the responsibility of OBL operation and he said that not only Pakistan’s intelligence agencies are responsible but international intelligence agencies are equally responsible (Osama Investigation, May 10, 2011, Dawn).

According to US defense official, during the raid in Abbottabad five people were killed and they fully equipped with weapons. OBL operation was a planned by US to kill



most wanted terrorist rather than arresting him. The most interesting fact editor mentioned relates to OBL with his family who have started living in well-established area of Abbottabad popularly known as Chak Shah Muhammad in 2005. This interesting fact shows failure of security agencies who have failed to find out the most dangerous terrorist in their own premises for more years (Ineffective defense, May 08, 2011, Dawn). After OBL operation, ISI Chief went to Washington DC after two months which gives slightly better news related to rocky Pak-US relations and the distrust, disbelief among the two ( ISI Chief's Visit, July 16, 2011, Dawn).

Editor of Dawn covered another slant negatively and discuss the statement of US officials who said that OBL was fully equipped when he was killed during the raid, moreover, he used one of his wives for self-defense (Extra-judicial killing, May 07, 2011, Dawn). One of the editorial highlighted another threatening fact that ISI, CIA and Pakistan military is constantly playing with citizens of Pakistan as they may think Pakistan's land and possessions are effectively controlled by foreign powers (Dawn, What sovereignty?, May 15, 2011).

The News also gave coverage to OBL operation and the editor of The News used negative slant related to Pakistan military. Editor was of the view that operation was initiated due to OBL presence in Pakistan which seems to be the failure of security agencies of Pakistan if they exist. Editor mention that responsibility of this operation is lying on the shoulder of Pakistan military and the intelligence agencies, as they had to perform effectively during the operation (The fall of Osama, May 3, 2011, The News).

US led operation at Abbottabad has revealed many secrets and among the most prominent is Air Chief Marshal accepted the failure of radar system breakdown. He told that some of radars towards west were closed because there not expecting any threat which shows that either air surveillance was adjourned because of no threat or it was purposefully suspended. CIA closely monitored Bin Laden's compound, surprisingly Pakistan military was neither aware with the existence of Bin Laden nor about Americans footsteps at Abbottabad (Failure and Trust, May 8, 2011, The News). Regardless of what Pakistan military says about Pakistan's freedom, Americans said that if they had doubt on Pakistan related to the existence of found terrorist they will initiate military operations without taking Pakistan military on board (The News, Failure and Trust, May 8, 2011). Editor mentioned that Obama administration is enjoying the success of OBL operation as the most wanted terrorist is killed, whereas Pakistan is paying heavy cost, a young FC soldier died in this operation though he did not have links with terrorist (The Taliban's Revenge, May 14, 2011, The News).

Editor once again repeated the ineffectiveness of Pakistan military and civilian government on this operation. Due to this operation Pakistan is facing external threat which may damage the integrity of Pakistan, its citizens and soldiers (Things fall Apart, June 3, 2011, The News). Editor shared the news about formation of commission after one month and Gen Lt (r) Nadeem Ahmed as one of the member of commission activated disagreement while giving interview to Australian radio channel by saying that security agencies of Pakistan were not aware of OBL operation. After this controversial discussion by Gen Lt (r) Nadeem Ahmed, Chief Justice Javed Iqbal came with clarification and said that these remarks are personal and they can't be part of facts for commission (Probe Controversy, July 22, 2011, The News).

### ***RQ3 How Dawn and The News covered themes in the context of OBL operation?***

***Table 2: Themes about the OBL operation***

<b>Themes</b>	<b>No of Editorials in Dawn</b>	<b>No of Editorials in The News</b>
Failure of military and civilian leadership	5	7

<i>Security Lapse</i>	4	7
<i>America's backstabbing or dual Collaboration</i>	1	2
<i>Historic accomplishment</i>	1	1
<i>False operation and fake Osama</i>	2	1
<i>Cross border stress by Afghan forces</i>	1	3
<i>External threats from India</i>	1	0
<i>Total Number of Editorials</i>	15	20

During the coverage of OBL operation both the newspapers covered diverse themes which shows that how the editor of both the newspapers frames the event in the minds of readers. Most of the themes show the frames which were against Pakistan military establishment and civilian government for their negligence, and their failure towards the presence of Osama on Pakistan's soil. Dawn has covered some diverse themes which were critical towards Pakistan military and intelligence agencies. Editor in one of the editorial covered the theme "**Momentous achievement**" which emphasized on significant victory for Obama administration and also it highlights that this operation is a revenge against 9/11 attack. Bin Laden an extremist who has stimulated more terrorism in the region is finally dead which resulted in end of an era, therefore, US believe that operation is the most significant development after years and this success has increased the worth of US terrorism policy (Osama bin Laden, May 03, 2011, Dawn).

Another striking theme covered in Dawn editorial is "**goodbye to the most haunted man**", The theme states that the most wanted man was killed in US led operation at Abbottabad and his body was further verified under the custody of US defense officials (Clean bowled, May 04, 2011, Dawn).

Dawn editor has discussed in another theme that OBL operation is "**A Botched Operation, Agendas & A Lost Opportunity**" "in the context of Afghanistan America dialogue. One of the most step taken by US administration was that they blacklist Al-Qaeda, and Taliban, and US security council announced that they will treat both of these groups separately (UN sanction' list , June 19, 2011, Dawn). The most interesting theme covered by Dawn editorial is "**False operation and Fake Osama**" which has raised different questions as no single picture of Osama's dead was not released by Us administration because many think that he died due to kidney failure in 2001 or 2009. The editor of Al Quds Al Arabi while talking to BBC on Tuesday said that media including journalists have the right to know the truth because people don't believe on facts disseminated by America (New Conspiracy, May 06, 2011, Dawn).

Another astonishing theme by Dawn editor is "**Cross border stress by Afghan forces**" which says that Pakistan for the first time send his soldiers at Afghan border in order to stop dispersion of Afghan forces. Likewise, the intensity of conflict between Pakistani and Afghan forces has reduced. A nerve-wracking news is of assault by Afghan fighters on western cross border of Pakistan (Strategic sensitivities, December 26, 2011, Dawn). After few days two most thought provoking themes are "**Dead Heat by ISI Chief**" and "**Dual Collaboration**" which explains that America and Pakistan share same enemy, therefore, both have to collaborate for their common interests (Senator Kerry's visit, May 18, 2011, Dawn). In another editorial same theme was covered which shows that OBL operation shows joint collaboration of both countries. It is in mutual interest of both the countries to work together in order to eliminate terrorist from entire region (Joint Struggle needed, May 06, 2011, Dawn).

It is further observed in Dawn editorial that ISI Chief Gen Pasha visited America after a month, he convinced American administration to restrict drone attacks to few areas of North Waziristan Agency (Fresh tensions, April 13, 2011, Dawn). The most dominating

theme covered by Dawn is “security failure” which is the actual cause of OBL operation, also it is narrated that Pakistan military forces are responsible for giving sage ground to Osama at Abbottabad, and there is no chance that Pakistan intelligence agencies were not aware with Osama’s presence. Editor further mentioned Pakistan ambassador who talked to Hussain Haqqani regarding the incompetence of Pakistan military agencies which should be investigated through independent commission, but he said that the facts of operation will remain ambiguous (Osama investigation, May 10, 2011, Dawn).

The News also constructed diverse themes in their editorials and the first theme covered by The News is “**External threats from India**” which clearly indicate that India always wanted the opportunity to pinpoint Pakistan by blaming that Pakistan is irresponsible for protecting terrorist on their soil, so is Afghanistan. (The fall of Osama, May 3, 2011, The News). Another dominating covered by The News is “**Security Failure**” which is similar to the theme covered by Dawn. The theme clearly signify that Pakistan military establishment and its security apparatus has not performed effectively because the most haunted man was on our soil and our radar system was unable to catch the helicopters which flew in Abbottabad (After Osama, May 5, 2011, The News).

Another powerful theme covered by The News is “**Blame on International Agencies**” which highlights the unabashed verdict of PM who said that failure to know Bin Laden’s presence at Abbottabad is not only the responsibility of intelligence agencies of Pakistan but our agencies are connected with the agencies of world (Tough truth, May 6, 2011, The News). According to perplexing theme of “**American’s Impassiveness**” it suggests that American administration has no regret and further, US defense official gave his statement that such operations will take place if Pakistan security agencies will not keep a check on terrorist. Americans argued that Pakistan was suspicious with reference to safe heavens of terrorist in Pakistan, therefore, Americans initiated this operation (Tough truth, May 6, 2011, The News).

Editor of The News covered the most eminent theme of “**Hypocritical America**” which states that both countries have to work with unity and both share same enemy (Munter’s job, May 11, 2011, The News). “**Army’s Degree of Credibility**” another prominent theme which focuses on Nawaz Sharif statement, he said official investigation is required by court in order to know pitfalls of Pakistan security agencies. He said that OBL operation has influenced the people of Pakistan, therefore, it’s important that security agencies were not aware with Osama’s presence and also Americans operation at Abbottabad (Probing question, May 13, 2011, The News).

“**Cry over Spilt Milk**” is another expected theme by editor of The News which says that the key players Deputy Chief of Air Staff Air Marshal Muhammad Hassan and Director General ISI Lt-Gen Ahmad Shuja Pasha both came out and said that they are strongly against US attack in Abbottabad and also Pakistan might discontinue NATO supply due to this operation (Daring Decision, May 15, 2011, The News). Another surprising theme covered by The News is “**Radicalization in Armed forces**” which states that armed forces should not strengthen fundamentalism as one of Brigadier was arrested after four days of this operation because of doubts that he may have connections with terrorists (House cleaning, July 23, 2011, The News).

Finally, last but not the least theme covered by The News is “**Double face of Pakistan Government**” which indicates the statement of Defense Minister Ahmed Mukhtar who said that Americans should halt drone attacks and should clear the Base, on the other side American administration said that they have not received any such kind of request from civilian government (The News, Air base confusion, July 7, 2011). Last theme covered by The News is “**Pakistan under US Command**”. The theme explains that Americans appreciated Pakistan for arresting most prominent terrorist of *AL-Qaeda* Younis al-Mauritani

but Pakistan rejected to hand over Shakeel Afridi who helped CIA in organizing polio campaign for arresting the most haunted terrorist (Ups and downs, September 7, 2011, The News).

#### **RQ4 How discourses are constructed by Dawn and The News in the context of OBL operation?**

##### **Discourses on OBL operation by Dawn**

The discourses constructed by Dawn were fabricated in a fashionable manner and such constructed discourses are Osama Bin Laden's signature attack (9/11), At such a tense juncture, the real state of alliance is shrouded in secrecy, The incident appears to be the deadliest of its kind, stumbling blocks, smack the arrogance of a superpower, continued acrimony, first breakthrough, run into hurdles of its own making, embarrassing for Pakistan.

##### **Discourses on OBL operation by The News**

The discourses made by The News pays attention to the failure of not only Pakistan armed forces(agencies)but also focused on the failure of civilian government as Palatial House, Bilateral Gambit, blame games serve no purpose, Pakistan and its security apparatus have become something of a laughing stock, Alleged double game, media spin masters had tried to portray a divide between state institutions, a veiled threat, Damb Squib, Rebukes, as far as PR goes the Americans have a mountain to climb

##### **Conclusion**

Critical discourse analysis of two newspapers i.e., Dawn and The News during the coverage of OBL operation negatively framed Pakistan military establishment, it is observed that both the newspapers showed dissatisfaction towards the failure of Pakistan intelligence agencies for existence of Osama's presence on Pakistan's territory. Both the newspapers condemn civilian government for not taking the responsibility of OBL operation and also critically examined the statements of PN Gilani for the delay in initiating independent commission for investigating the truth associated with this operation. Both the newspapers also highlighted the most dominant frame of security lapse and aggressively discuss the role of military towards sovereignty of Pakistan, also towards protecting the slogan of independent state, as US defense official said that in future such operations will take place they have suspicions on Pakistan intelligence agencies. According to results Dawn used less harsh towards the coverage of OBL operation whereas The News being critical used harsh tone and aggressive words during the editorial coverage of OBL operation. Editorials of both newspapers focused on the statements released by military and civilian government because Americans didn't released any picture of Osama's death which has generated another conspiracy. Therefore, both the newspapers focused on statements released by either military or civilian officials. To conclude, both the newspapers not only covered OBL operation but they also set the frames and constructed the themes in such a way that influenced people's perception towards inefficiency of Pakistan military establishment for not being aware of US led operation and Bin Laden who was miles away from military academy.

##### **Policy Recommendations**

- Media plays a vital role in the calculus of political aggression, so during the coverage of terrorism related issues it either maximize or minimize the coverage of events in order to influence the masses. Therefore, it is recommended that media should alter symbiotic relationship between media and terrorism related events and should represent the narrative in a less sensational way.
- Media should not overemphasize terrorist related information which goes against the sovereignty of Pakistan and also it shouldn't benefit the external forces/terrorist based organizations working against Pakistan.

- Ministry of information should take into confidence the media owners, professionals and journalist and develop ethics which could streamline the passage for filtered information.

## References

- Ahmed, I. (2018). Trump's tweet and media treat: A Critical discourse analysis of US and Pakistani newspapers.
- Ali, Z., Jan, M., & Saleem, N. (2013). Portrayal of Pakistan by US leading news magazines. *Science International*, 25(4).
- Ayoub, U., & Ahmed, T. (2013). Portrayal of Pakistan-USA relationship with reference to drone strikes on Waziristan in the editorials of Dawn and Nation: A comparative study. *Academic Research International*, 4(6), 56.
- Baker, P. (2012). Acceptable bias? Using corpus linguistics methods with critical discourse analysis. *Critical discourse studies*, 9(3), 247-256.
- Baran, Z. (2008). The Muslim Brotherhood's US Network. *Current Trends in Islamist Ideology*, 6, 95.
- Biber, D. (1991). *Variation across speech and writing*. Cambridge University Press.
- Bilal, H. A., Razaqat, U., Hassan, N., Mansoor, H., & Zahra, Q. (2012). Editorials of Pakistani English print media: Application of CDA. *International Journal of Linguistics*, 4(3), 744-754.
- Burke, K. (1969). *A rhetoric of motives*. Univ of California Press.
- Chong, D., & Druckman, J. N. (2007). A theory of framing and opinion formation in competitive elite environments. *Journal of communication*, 57(1), 99-118.
- Coleman, R., McCombs, M., Shaw, D., & Weaver, D. (2009). Agenda setting. *The handbook of journalism studies*, 147-160.
- Cordesman, A. H. (2011). The Broader Crisis in Iraq. *Center for Strategic and International Studies*.
- Dar, A., & Ali, S. (2015). How Pakistani and the US elite print media painted issue of drone attacks: Framing analysis of the News International and the New York Times. *Global Media Journal: Pakistan Edition*, 8(2), 1-17.
- Dimitrova, D. V., & Strömbäck, J. (2008). Foreign policy and the framing of the 2003 Iraq War in elite Swedish and US newspapers. *Media, War & Conflict*, 1(2), 203-220.
- Dorman, W. A., & Farhang, M. (1988). *The US press and Iran: Foreign policy and the journalism of deference*. Univ of California Press.
- Entman, R. M., & Rojecki, A. (1993). Freezing out the public: Elite and media framing of the US anti-nuclear movement.
- Fairclough, N. (1992). Discourse and text: Linguistic and intertextual analysis within discourse analysis. *Discourse & society*, 3(2), 193-217.
- Fairclough, N. (1995). *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language*. London: Longman.
- Fairclough, N. (1995b) *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language*. London: Longman.
- Fairclough, N. (1995b). *Media Discourse*. London: Edward Arnold
- Fairclough, N. (2001a) The discourse of New Labour: critical discourse analysis, in M. Wetherall, S. Taylor and S. Yates (eds.) *Discourse as Data. A Guide for Analysis*. (London: Sage/Open University), 229 – 266.
- Galtung, J., & Vincent, R. C. (1992). *Global glasnost: Toward a new world information and communication order?*. Hampton Press (NJ).
- Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame analysis: An essay on the organization of experience*. Harvard University Press.
- Hameed, N. (2015). Struggling IDPS of North Waziristan in the wake of operation Zarb-e-Azb. *NDU Journal*, 29(1).
- Happer, C., & Philo, G. (2013). The role of the media in the construction of public belief and social change. *Journal of social and political psychology*, 1(1), 321-336.

- Henry, F., & Tator, C. (2002). *Discourses of domination: Racial bias in the Canadian English-language press*. University of Toronto Press.
- Kellner, D. (2007). Bushspeak and the politics of lying: presidential rhetoric in the “war on terror”. *Presidential Studies Quarterly*, 37(4), 622-645.
- Khan, R. M. (2013). Negotiations with TTP: An analysis of counter terrorism strategy. *NDU Journal*, 27, 65-92.
- McCombs, M. E., & Shaw, D. L. (1972). The agenda-setting function of mass media. *Public opinion quarterly*, 36(2), 176-187.
- Miller, Greg (May 5, 2011). ["CIA spied on bin Laden from safe house"](#). *The Washington Post*. Retrieved May 6, 2011.
- Muin, M. J. (2011). Agenda-setting theory and the role of the media in shaping public opinion for the Iraq war.
- Price, V., Tewksbury, D., & Powers, E. (1997). Switching trains of thought: The impact of news frames on readers' cognitive responses. *Communication research*, 24(5), 481-506.
- Richardson, E. (2007). She was working like foreal': critical literacy and discourse practices of African American females in the age of hip hop. *Discourse & Society*, 18(6), 789-809.
- Richardson, J. (2006). *Analysing newspapers: An approach from critical discourse analysis*. Palgrave.
- Saleem, N. (2007). US media framing of foreign countries image: An analytical perspective. *Canadian Journal of Media Studies*, 2(1), 130-162.
- Shoemaker, P. J., & Reese, S. D. (1996). *Mediating the message* (pp. 781-795). White Plains, NY: Longman.
- Siraj, S. A. (2008). War or peace journalism in elite US newspapers: Exploring news framing in Pakistan-India conflict. *Strategic Studies*, 28(1), 194-222.
- Teo, P. (2000). Racism in the news: A critical discourse analysis of news reporting in two Australian newspapers. *Discourse & society*, 11(1), 7-49.
- Van Dijk, T. A. (1994). Discourse and inequality. *Lenguas Modernas*, (21), 19-37.
- Van Dijk, T. A. (1995). Discourse semantics and ideology. *Discourse & society*, 6(2), 243-289.
- Van Dijk, T. A. (1998). *Ideology: A multidisciplinary approach*. Sage.
- Van Dijk, T. A. (2000). New (s) racism: A discourse analytical approach. *Ethnic minorities and the media*, 37, 33-49.
- Van Dijk, T. A. (2001). Discourse, ideology and context. *Folia Linguistica*, 35(1-2), 1-2.
- Williams, B. G. (2010). The CIA's covert Predator drone war in Pakistan, 2004–2010: the history of an assassination campaign. *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism*, 33(10), 871-892.
- Winch, S. P. (2005). Constructing an “Evil Genius”: news uses of mythic archetypes to make sense of bin Laden. *Journalism Studies*, 6(3), 285-299.
- Yousaf, S. (2015). Representations of Pakistan: A framing analysis of coverage in the US and Chinese news media surrounding operation Zarb-e-Azb. *International Journal of Communication*.