Journal of Peace, Development and Communication

Article:	**Content Analysis of the New York Times and the Guardian on Framing of Chinese Muslims and Islam**
Author(s):	Naheem Gul Lecturer, Department of Media and Communication Studies National University of Modern Languages (NUML), Rawalpindi Campus
	Adeel Shahzad Lecturer, Department of Media and Communication Studies National University of Modern Languages (NUML), Rawalpindi Campus
Published:	30th March 2024
Publisher Information:	Journal of Peace, Development and Communication (JPDC)
To Cite this Article:	Gul, N., & Shahzad, A. (2024). Content Analysis of the New York Times and the Guardian on Framing of Chinese Muslims and Islam. *Journal of Peace, Development and Communication, 08*(01), 103–111. https://doi.org/10.36968/JPDC-V08-I01-09
Author(s) Note:	Naheem Gul is serving as a Lecturer at Department of Media and Communication Studies, National University of Modern Languages (NUML), Rawalpindi Campus
	Adeel Shahzad is serving as a Lecturer at Department of Media and Communication Studies, National University of Modern Languages (NUML), Rawalpindi Campus

ABSTRACT

In this study, researcher has analyzed one year news stories of elite English newspapers The New York Times and The Guardian and found N=172 stories related to the conditions of Chinese Muslims and Islam in China by using different framing categories which are Anti-terrorism, Extremism, Conflict, Crime, Culture and Religion, International Efforts and Dehumanizing Act. N=63 are from The Guardian Newspaper and N=109 are from The New York Times that shows the western media has given the favorable N=109 stories to the Chinese Muslims and Islam in China. The framing theory has been adopted as a theoretical framework in this study. This content analysis of selected western newspapers, the results of framing themes represented that the western media have at least focused on the Chinese Muslims. The coding frame of international efforts showed that US is showing more concerns about the rights of Muslims in China.

Key Words: China, Islam, Muslims, Uyghur Muslims, Xinjiang, Islamophobia

Introduction

A fast analysis of Chinese history and Uyghur shows few trends of how China is dealing with its large country and millions of other minority populations. China continues to keep its minorities under full surveillance and with little influence over them and their culture, from keeping minority people fully separate to the slow but steady movement towards constructing one united nation (Baez I. , 2020).

Xinjiang is like home to the predominantly Uyghur Muslims, where Chinese abuses against minority groups has accumulated for years. Investigative journalists, writers, and refugees portray a dystopian image of mass monitoring activities, forced imprisonment, forced labor, systematic incarceration, extreme torture and assassination. Not only has the Chinese government engaged in cultural and political persecution, but it has explicitly targeted the faith of Muslim: during Ramadan, it has demolished mosques, confiscated Qurans, outlawed halal foods, and banned on fasting (Jazeera, 2015)

Yet most of the nations and organizations that often condemn Israel, Myanmar, US, and many other countries for their acts targeting Muslims have remained silent about the treatment of the Uyghurs by China. In an attempt to bring the predicament of the Uyghurs to wider notice, activists are trying to organize boycotts, marches and campaigns on media. Their actions are slowly changing the decisions of the governments: investment of China and its political power may stop most of the politicians by facing public criticism on China, but in response to criticism from below, opposition members and officials of the government have started to speak at lower levels (Farida, 2019).

In diverse dimensions of social life in China, studies have indicated that malice has become extensive against Muslims: it stretches explicit hate speech to implicit expressions like opposition of construction of the new mosques, towards Islamic values and practices and Muslims, or the apparent "preferential treatment" of all Muslim minorities (Palmer, 2019).
The origins of the Xinjiang dispute are understood only by comparing official and unofficial policies. The Chinese government's cultural policy is equitable and accommodationist. But since the 1980s, its unofficial (covert) policy has concentrated on assimilating the major minorities of Xinjiang, especially the Uyghurs, to the dominant culture of China (Sautman, 2007).

With Magnet sky-style sanctions and breaking of business ties, the international communities are continuously pushing back on Chinese actions in the region of Xinjiang, and even Hong Kong. In July, a group of human rights organizations said that as much as one out of five cotton products sold internationally was linked to Xinjiang's forced labor programs. The H&M clothing empire in Sweden said on Tuesday that it had been phased out its trade deals with Xinjiang suppliers "before we get clarity about forced labor accusations" (Davidosn, 2020).

Problem Statement

According to the official statement of China Islam Association there are about 23 million Muslims who are residing in 27 provinces in China; most of them are Uyghur and Hui. As China has a controlled and state-owned media, so only central level media like Xinhua News Agency, CCTV permitted to cover international news. So due to controlled media the Muslims representation in news media is the one and the only source for the citizens of China to get an understanding about Muslims and Islam (Luqiu & Yang, 2018). Chinese government

has been deeply involved in foreign affairs, related to Muslim world, such as Syrian War and an active strategic and economic partner of Pakistan, just because to be seen as a responsible world's leader. After 9/11, Islamophobia gained extensive coverage in West as well as East. Many of the Islamic countries are coming closer to China due to China's Economic Cooperation. Hence it is necessary to know that how China is behaving with Islam and Muslims in China.

Objectives

- To investigate whether and to what extent and nature of Islamophobic contents about Chinese Muslims and Islam in China find space in The New York Times and The Guardian.
- To examine the news coverage of The New York Times and The Guardian about Islam and Muslims in China.
- To analyze key framing strategies used by The New York Times and The Guardian in their coverage of Muslims and Islam in China.

Significance

China is an emerging superpower. Due to its economic cooperation through One Belt One Road (OBOR) project, this will connect China with the West. China is gaining its support in the Muslim World. Many of the Muslim nations are direct partners of China in this project. So it is need of time to know, how Chinese government, people and Media are behaving with Islam and Muslims in China. This study is an endeavor to understand the nature of Islamophobia in China carried by The New York Times and The Guardian Newspapers. The study also helps to explain the dominant frames applied by these newspapers in their portrayal of Muslims and Islam in China.

Literature Review

Islamophobia is a composite and multi-dimensional construct with its epistemic/symbolic dimensions with having different connotations, its meaning needs to be distilled through its explication into less abstract dimensions (Iqbal Z. , 2020).

Bazian (2018) said that Islamophobia as a problem is frequently argued to be a logical choice by the coverage of media which stereotype the Islam and Muslims, since it refers to the symptom rather than the origin of the main cause. As postulated in the thesis of Huntington with the name of "Clash of Civilizations", the threat of Islam is the element that is required to confirm self-identification of the west after the Cold War and the absence of a specific threat or intent from which the West can identify, unify, and assert the future (Massoumi, Mills, & Miller, 2017).

There were indications of Islamophobia, or indiscriminate derogatory attitudes or emotions aimed at Islam and Muslims in some of the debate. In comparison to the "bad Muslims" who act as rhetorical rivals, other reports revealed signs of Islamophobia, which is the stereotypical representation of 'good Muslims' who are model people (Bowe & Makki, 2015).

In the research of (Sardar & Davies, 2010) of "Freeze Framing Muslims Hollywood and the Slideshow of Western Imagination" that image of Islam and Muslims in the West have been captured in the history and replicated with the mundane regularity. At the beginning of Islam, these 'freeze frames' originated and have acquired some key points and descriptors through centuries.

Researcher analyzed that substantial literature is easily available to agree with the idea that by framing, representation and shaping, media create reality by providing a mass-mediated view.

As Iqbal, Rahim, Gazzaz, & Ahrari, 2010 has warned, "Negative portrayal of Muslims in the Western media is globalized and if allowed to continue may eventuate into some kind of clash of civilizations with horrendous consequences for human civilization on the planet". Political discourses, online media like social media and mainstream media become sometimes "a vehicle for hateful political beliefs, ideologies and actions" (Alcántara-Plá & Ruiz-Sánchez, 2017).

A study that records China's widespread anti-Muslim sentiments in online and the use of social media by Muslims of China from different backgrounds to deal with and react to this hostile discourse in online public sphere. Researchers reviewed more than 10,000 posts from social media about Muslims and Islam on online platform Weibo and conducted in-depth interviews from 34 Chinese Muslims whom are active social media users. Nevertheless, Muslims of China continue to face multiple risks and hurdles, particularly in dealing with the ideological dispute between their religion and the ruling party which has an atheistic approach, due to censorship by the government and the prevalent Han-centric discourse (Tan, 2020). Uyghur history and literature review survey shows that the Uyghur Muslims are in crisis with a lack of the religious freedom and a lack of coverage given to them by media about what is going on in Western China at current time.

Anwar, Musyafak, & Musyrifin, 2019 in their research, clarified that counseling is indeed a psychological service offered by individuals with the ability to listen well, the ability to understand everyone else and the ability to humanize individuals. One Islamic individual, who teaches about the culture of Islam in China to build a Pesantren that has now expanded, owns these skills. Islam in China is not really problematic because the government of China also identifies that Islam is part of that culture which has existed since prehistoric times. The main purpose of this article has been drawn the attention towards Uyghur Muslims in the Xinjiang province, population which has been already oppressed by Chinese government for hundreds of years and yet, has got little to no support and recognition.

Theoretical Framework

Coverage of conflict has always been taken as a very sensitive phenomenon among the communication researchers (Aslam, 2014). The coverage matter more than the actual happenings. This study designed to get benefit from framing theory; coding frames are Antiterrorism, Extremism, Conflict, Crime, Culture and religion, International Efforts and Dehumanizing Act. The straightforward reason is to study frames to understand the situation of Chinese Muslims and Islam in China and coverage of the Muslims and Islam in China by the Elite Press of US and UK, The New York Times and The Guardian respectively.

Framing Theory

Framing theory concentrates on the courses through which news organizations depiction the truth. Media content limits general assessments, for example, by grabbing a few parts of war truths–like military advancement– and disregarding other substances of realities. Those who comprehend war as a military success may become more supportive of it in the end (Dimitrova & Strömbäck, 2005). In mass media research framing is not new conceived, there are various definitions of framing theory in circle of the academic community. For the most

part news framing is intangible nature; different viewpoints that frame the piece of media coverage as well as a feature of crowd scholarly mappings (Manuel, 2007).

Research Questions

RQ1. How much coverage given to the Muslims and Islam in China in The New York Times and The Guardian Newspapers?

RQ2. Whether The New York Times and The Guardian Newspapers used favorable frames in filing the stories about Chinese Muslims and Islam in China?

RQ3. Whether the framing of Muslims differs in The New York Times and The Guardian?

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study is focused on content analysis that will analyze the definite news categories in The Guardian and The New York Times news publication quantitatively. The period of the study is one year from January 1, 2020 to December 31, 2020.

Population

The population of this study is the news stories which are relevant to Islam in China and Chinese Muslims published in the Western English newspaper, The New York Times and The Guardian. The sample of the research study is all news stories, articles and editorials which are about Muslims and Islam in China. The news stories have been collected from the news archival of The New York Times and The Guardian Newspapers, website and also with the help of Lexis-Nexus.

Frames

To identify frame, frames of Antiterrorism, Extremism, Conflict, Crime, Culture and Religion, International Efforts and Dehumanizing Act have been used in this research. The researcher will be analyzed the complete story from point of view of the text to find the respective frames. In this chapter, the coding structure in a story was discussed separately. The placement of the article in this study is referred to in the newspapers as a news story, feature and editorial.

Coding Unit

My coding unit is News stories. (Siraj, 2006) Defined that a word or a symbol is typically the smallest analysis unit, while the largest type of material is the context unit. Context units set the limits on the part of written information to be analyzed for word or statement categories. The entire story will be the context unit and unit of analysis, while slant and frame will be observed as variables and to quantify these variables. From the textual point of view, the researcher will examine the entire story to define frames.

RESEARCH FINDINGS

The whole newspapers were taken for stories about Muslims and Islam in China. The final sample contained 172 stories, with 63 (36.6%) being from The Guardian and 109 (63.4%) being from The New York Times.

Table: 1 Total number of Stories in Newspapers

		Frequency
Valid	The Guardian	63 (36.6%)
	The New York Times	109 (63.4%)
	Total	172 (100%)

Table 1 describes the overall stories which have been analyzed in this research. The total number of stories are N=172. The number of stories in The Guardian are N=63. And the N=109 of stories are from The New York Times.

Table: 2 Slant Representation Category Wise

Categories * Slant Cross tabulation

		Slant			Total
		Favorable	Unfavorable	Neutral	
Categories	Conflict	23	12	0	35
	Crime	1	0	0	1
	Culture and Religion	21	32	0	53
	International Efforts	54	9	1	64
	Dehumanizing Act	10	9	0	19
Total		109	62	1	172

Table 2 shows the results of slants used by selected newspapers which are favorable, unfavorable and Neutral by category wise. The conflict category showed 23 favorable, 12 unfavorable and 0 neutral to Muslims, Islam in china and total stories in this category are 35. The category of crime showed the slant of 1 favorable, 0 to unfavorable and 0 neutral and total stories in this category is 1. The favorable stories are 21, 32 unfavorable and 0 neutral in the category of culture and religion so the total number of stories are 53. In the category of international efforts the favorable stories are 54, unfavorable 9 and 1 neutral and total stories in this category are 64. The category of Dehumanizing act have the total number of stories 19, in which 10 favorable, 9 favorable and 0 neutral.

Table 3: Newspaper * Categories Cross tabulation

Count		Categories					
		Conflict	Crime	Culture and Religion	International Efforts	Dehumanizing Act	Total
Newspaper	The Guardian	9	0	19	29	6	63
	The New York Times	26	1	34	35	13	109
Total		35	1	53	64	19	172

Table 3 shows the result of category which are used as frames. The frame of conflict has 9 stories, crime 0, culture and religion 19, international efforts 29 and dehumanizing act have 6 stories used in The Guardian and total number of stories are 63 from this newspaper. But The New York Times have used these frames, in conflict frame 26, crime 1, culture and religion 34, international efforts 35 and dehumanizing act have 13 and total stories are in this newspaper 109.

Discussion and Conclusion

This research has investigated the two western newspapers which are The Guardian from United Kingdom and The New York Times from United State. The stories which have analyzed are 172 from both selected newspapers. The New York Times has covered more than The Guardian. Total seven frames were adopted for this study which is Antiterrorism, Extremism, Conflict, Crime, Culture and Religion, International Efforts and Dehumanizing act.

The first five frames were used but the researcher added two more frames for this study. The study showed that Antiterrorism and Extremism frame was not used in selected newspapers. But the other frames such as International Efforts used highly in The New York Times and total number of stories in this frame are 35 but The Guardian used this frame in 29 stories and total stories are 64 so the results showed that framing and coverage of international efforts are much more higher in The New York Times than The Guardian. The frame of Conflict which has been used in The Guardian just in stories but The New York Times used it in 26 stories which showed that The New York Times focused on it and represented as conflict and total number of the stories in this category are 35.

The New York Times used the frame of Culture and Religion in 34 stories but The Guardian used in 19 stories so the total number of stories in this category is 53. This represents that coverage of culture and religion frames is more dominant in The New York Times than The Guardian. The Dehumanizing Act frame is more dominant in The New York Times that 13 stories out of 109 but The Guardian used it in this frame only 6 stories. The last one frame Crime which is used negligibly as The New York Times used it only in 1 stories and no story found in this frame from The Guardian.

The western media inform the masses by reporting different efforts making by different countries in which these countries are trying to put pressure on China to release Muslims from these so call re-education camps. The US has direct conflict with China in trade war and economic tension so that the US media has given more coverage to the Chinese Muslims and Islam in China. But the United Kingdom has no direct conflict with China so it has given slightly less coverage. The frames of Antiterrorism and extremism which are not focused by western media with the respect of Muslims and Islam in china. The religious and cultural practices are very important for Muslims so the Chinese media is discriminated the Muslims during coverage of Islam and Muslims but the western media is pro-Muslims regarding Chinese Muslims and Islam in China. The area Uyghur is converted to the detention center for Muslims meant that house of Chinese Muslims is actual detention center. The security is so tight to Uyghur Muslims and Chinese media has literally discriminated them but the western media is covering the situation of Muslims in China and bring this issue in light so that the world understand the importance of that issue.

Framing of Chinese Muslims and Islam

References

Alcántara-Plá, M., & Ruiz-Sánchez, A. (2017). The framing of muslims on the Spanish internet. Lodz Papers in Pragmatics, 13(2), 261-283.

Anwar, M. K., Musyafak, N., & Musyrifin, Z. (2020). CHINESE PESANTREN AND CHINA'S ACCEPTANCE TO ISLAM A study on Counseling Spirit in Chinese Pesantren Hu Dengzhou Jingtang Jiaoyu. Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism, 8(2), 117-130.

Aslam, R. (2014). The role of media in conflict: Integrating peace journalism in the journalism curriculum (Doctoral dissertation, Auckland University of Technology).

Baez, I. (2020). Islam in China: Uyghurs in Crisis.

Bowe, B. J., & Makki, T. W. (2016). Muslim neighbors or an Islamic threat? A constructionist framing analysis of newspaper coverage of mosque controversies. Media, Culture & Society, 38(4), 540-558.

Carney, T. F. (1971). Content analysis: A review essay. Historical Methods Newsletter, 4(2), 52-61.

Castells, M. (2007). Communication, power and counter-power in the network society. International journal of communication, 1(1), 29.

Davidson, H. Clues to scale of Xinjiang labour operation emerge as China defends camps. The Guardian.

Deif, F. China's treatment of Muslims a defining moment for the organization of Islamic Cooperation's

Dimitrova, D. V., & Strömbäck, J. (2005). Mission accomplished? Framing of the Iraq War in the elite newspapers in Sweden and the United States. Gazette (Leiden, Netherlands), 67(5), 399-417.

https://foreignpolicy.com/2019/01/05/chinas-muslims-brace-for-attacks/ (Retrieved on 4 December 2022)

https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2015/6/18/china-bans-muslims-from-fasting-ramadan-in-xinjiang (Retrieved on 4 December 2022)

Iqbal, Z. (2019). Islamophobia: History, Context and Deconstruction. Sage Publications Pvt. Limited.

Khan, F. R., Iqbal, Z., Gazzaz, O. B., & Ahrari, S. (2012). Global media image of Islam and Muslims and the problematics of a response strategy. Islamic studies, 5-25.

Luqiu, L. R., & Yang, F. (2018). Islamophobia in China: news coverage, stereotypes, and Chinese Muslims' perceptions of themselves and Islam. Asian Journal of Communication, 28(6), 598-619.

Massoumi, N., Mills, T., & Miller, D. (2017). What is Islamophobia? Racism, social movements and the state. Pluto Press.

Sautman, B. (2013). Preferential policies for ethnic minorities in China: The case of Xinjiang. In Nationalism and ethnoregional identities in China (pp. 86-118). Routledge.

Siraj, S. A. (2006). Image of Pakistan in the US media: Exploring news framing. University of Southern Illinois Carbondale, USA.

Tan, J. (2023). Digital Masquerade: Feminist Rights and Queer Media in China (Vol. 30). NYU Press.